1-A

1971


தமிழ்நாடு சட்டமன்றப் பேரவை
TAMIL NADU LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY
வாய்மையே வெல்லும்
TRUTH ALONE TRIUMPHS

The Council re-assembled at the Council Chamber, Fort St. George, at 11 a.m., on Tuesday the 8th March 1921, the Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Sir P. RAJAGOPALA ACHARIYAR, K.C.S.I., C.I.E., presiding.

I

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

[*Order made by the President of the Madras Legislative Council under Standing Order No.* 15.]

(1) Printed copies of the questions and answers to be put and given at a meeting of the Council shall be placed on the Council table an hour before the President takes his seat.

(2) The questions shall be put and answered in the following manner :—

The Secretary shall call the name of each interpellator in alphabetical order, specify the serial numbers of his questions, and make a sufficient pause to allow him or any other member a reasonable opportunity of rising in his place if he is desirous of asking a supplementary question. Supplementary questions must be put immediately after the principal questions to which they relate.]

Maintenance of Buckingham Canal.

392 Q.—Diwan Bahadur C. ARUNACHALA MUDALIYAR : To ask the Hon'ble the Member for Revenue—

(*a*) to furnish in respect of the maintenance of the Buckingham Canal both north of Madras and south of Madras statement showing—

(i) the allotment for repairs including silt clearance during the last three years,

(ii) expenditure actually incurred,

(iii) the percentage of expenditure to allotment,

(iv) the agency employed for carrying out the repairs ;

(*b*) whether the canal cannot be maintained in a navigable condition throughout the year.

A.—(*a*) (i) to (iii) A statement showing the allotment for and expenditure incurred on repairs to the Buckingham Canal during the years 1917-18, 1918-19 and 1919-20 is shown below :—

	1917-18.	1918-19.	1919-20.
	RS.	RS.	RS.
1. Budget grant ..	89,960	1,04,959	1,50,000
2. Final grant ..	1,02,794	1,50,292	1,84,900
3. Expenditure incurred.	1,02,577	1,53,564	1,86,489
Percentage of 3 to 2	100	102	101

(iv) The works were carried out by Public Works Department contractors.

(*b*) The Buckingham Canal is designed for a depth of 3 feet only north of Madras and 2 feet south of Madras ; and it is ordinarily maintained to this depth throughout the year. But as it is a tidal canal entirely dependent on sea water for replenishment and as sometimes heavy silt deposits are brought down into the canal by floods during the north-east monsoon, some unavoidable obstructions to traffic are liable to be formed. Such obstructions are removed as promptly as possible.

Kistna reservoir project.

393 *Q.*—Rao Sahib P. C. ETHIRAJULU NAYUDU: To ask the Hon'ble the Member for Revenue to state in what stage the Kistna reservoir project investigated by the Government a few years ago to irrigate the non-deltaic area of the Guntūr district is and to lay the papers relating to the same on the Council table.

A.—Attention is invited to the answer to question No. 155 asked at the meeting of the Legislative Council held on the 11th March 1919. The Government do not consider that any useful purpose would be served by the publication of the papers.

Land acquisition for depressed classes.

394 *Q.*—Rao Sahib P. C. ETHIRAJULU NAYUDU: To ask the Hon'ble the Law Member—

(*a*) to state if the Government intend to acquire suitable lands for building purposes and to provide sites for the needy and also to the depressed classes of the villages; and

(*b*) to state the action the Government have taken on the proposals recently made by the Special Deputy Collector on the subject and to lay the papers on the subject on the Council table.

A.—(*a*) Yes, for depressed classes.

(*b*) There is at present no special officer for acquisition of house-sites in the district and no proposals on the subject of provision of house-sites have recently been received by Government.

Recruitment of Deputy Collectors.

395 *Q.*—To ask the Hon'ble the Member for Revenue if it is a fact that no non-Brahman Hindu was directly recruited as a deputy collector for the last one decade and over.

A.—It is not a fact.

Fee for Muhammadan pupils in Malabar.

396 *Q.*—Mr. K. KUNHAMMAD KOYA: To ask the Hon'ble the Minister for Education whether it is a fact that, in some Government and aided colleges and schools in the Malabar district, full fees are being levied from Muhammadan pupils, and if so, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether the concession of half fees to Muhammadan pupils is no longer in general application and what, in this event, are the grounds for the restricted application of the concession.

A.—The Government have no information but will enquire as regards the Government institutions. The levy of fees in aided colleges and schools is left to the option of the management but Government reimburse to the management the entire loss of fee income up to half the standard fee rate.

The concession of half fees is still of general application. Attention is invited to revised rule 102 of the Madras Educational Rules published in notification No. 39, dated the 18th January 1921, on page 86 of Part I-B of the *Fort St. George Gazette*, dated the 25th January 1921, which restricts this concession to really poor students.

8th March 1921]

(Agricultural Department.)

397 Q.—Mr. A. RANGANATHA MUDALIYAR: To ask the Hon'ble the Minister for Development—

(*a*) whether it is the policy of the Government to indianise the Agricultural Department as soon as possible, and, if so, what steps have been taken to achieve that object, and if the Government will avail themselves of the earliest opportunity to appoint an Indian as Director of Agriculture;

(*b*) what the proportion is of Indians to non-Indians in the Indian Agricultural Service;

(*c*) how many circles are in charge of Assistant Directors of Agriculture, or in additional charge of Deputy Directors, and for what periods;

(*d*) who the Assistant Directors are who are now acting as Deputy Directors, and how long they have been so acting; and

(*e*) whether the Government will consider the question of their confirmation in their present appointments if they are competent to hold them, and have hitherto discharged their duties satisfactorily.

A.—(*a*) It is the desire of this Government to indianise the Agricultural Department as far as practicable without detriment to efficiency. With this object in view this Government recommended to the Government of India three of their Indian officers to be drafted into the Imperial Service, but the indianisation of the Agricultural Department is a matter to be decided by the Government of India and is largely dependent on the agricultural education obtainable in India and the class of candidate forthcoming.

(*b*), (*c*) & (*d*) The Member is referred to the information given in the Quarterly Civil List corrected up to 1st January 1921. Subsequent to the publication of the Civil List another officer (M.R.Ry. K. Govinda Kidavu Avargal) has been appointed to act as Deputy Director from 21st November 1920.

(*e*) The Member is referred to the arrangements published in paragraphs 9 and 12 of Annexure 1 to the Report of the Public Services Commission regarding a Selection Committee. Selected Provincial officers will, it is understood, have to appear from time to time before the Committee in future.

Additional taxation to meet new expenditure.

398 Q.—Mr. T. RICHMOND: To ask the Hon'ble the Member for Finance—

(*a*) to state the cost of the different services before and after the recent grant of enhanced salaries to public officials down to and including village servants; and

(*b*) to state if the Government contemplate any additional taxation in the near future to meet this enhanced expenditure and to introduce and carry on measures for the expansion of education, improvement of sanitation and development of industries involving recurring expenditure.

A.—The following table shows the cost of the Imperial, Provincial, subordinate and village services in 1917–18 and the estimated cost for 1921–22:—

	1917–18.	1921–22.
Imperial	59·05	94·09
Provincial	40·02	55·06
Subordinate	299·64	394·45
Village	70·25	114·49

The Government look to local bodies in the first instance to utilize the powers of taxation given them under the Elementary Education Act and the Acts relating to municipalities and local boards for the purpose of raising larger funds for education and sanitation. The question whether taxation will be necessary to meet the enhanced salary bill and for the development of industries will be examined as soon as a decision has been come to as to the amount that will have to be paid in the shape of salaries.

Irrigation in Gōdāvari, Kistna and Guntūr.

399 Q.—Mr. A. SUBBARAYUDU: To ask the Hon'ble the Member for Revenue—

(*a*) how many applications for water for first crop were made in the years 1918–19 and 1919–20 in the districts of Gōdāvari, Kistna and Guntūr, and how many of them were rejected, and what the amount was of penalty collected in each district during the said years for unauthorized irrigation; and

(*b*) to give this information separately for the Bhimavaram taluk of the Kistna district.

A.—The information is not in the possession of Government.

Dyeing and leather experts.

400 Q.—Mr. A. SUBBARAYUDU: To ask the Hon'ble the Minister for Development to state how long the dyeing and leather experts have been in the service of the Government, and what the nature is of the work done by them for the benefit of private and public industries.

A.—The Dyeing Chemist who is now called Industrial Chemist joined his appointment on the 25th March 1911 and the Leather Expert took charge on 1st September 1911. The work done by them will be found in the annual administration reports of the Department of Industries which are available to the public.

Owing to the absence of suitable laboratories in Madras, the Industrial Chemist is working at the Indian Institute of Science, Bangalore, since last August where he has been carrying on research work.

II

Discussion on the budget.

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT:—"Before the Honourable Members begin the discussion of the budget, I hope they will permit me to read to them the rule under which this discussion is allowed. Rule 28 of the Legislative Council rules says: 'On a day to be appointed by the Governor subsequent to the day on which the budget is presented and for such time as the Governor may allot for this purpose, the Council shall be at liberty to discuss the budget as a whole or any question of principle involved therein, but no motion shall be moved at this stage, nor shall the budget be submitted to the vote of the Council'.

"That is the discussion which the Council is to hold to-day and for the next two days. Honourable Members will see that the object is to provide for a discussion of the budget as a whole or of questions of principle involved therein. The votes on the detailed grants will come at a later stage. Then, sub-rule (3) says: that the President may, if he thinks fit, prescribe a limit for speeches.

8th March 1921] [The Hon'ble the President]

I think it is but fair to members that a time limit should be fixed. We have only three days before us and the number of members is 120. I have therefore resolved to fix a time limit of 20 minutes for each member. I trust that Honourable Members will abide by that limit and regulate their speeches accordingly."

Diwan Bahadur M. KRISHNAN NAYAR :—"Sir, a perusal of the Hon'ble the Finance Member's memorandum as a whole shows that there is a very earnest desire to economise, during the coming year, the expenditure as far as possible. It is specifically stated further that under the personal supervision of His Excellency pruning scissors will be applied rather rigorously to the whole machinery of administration from top to bottom during the coming year. Sir, if I may be permitted to say so, this is really a matter for congratulation, for, it is only by economy, by very stringent economy, that funds can be obtained for the development of those departments which are entrusted to the Ministers. They are mostly 'Development departments,' or if not technically 'Development departments,' they are departments which require larger and larger additions of expenditure year after year. These departments are Agriculture, Industries, Education and so on. Economy is necessary for more reasons than one. In the first place, our revenues are not very elastic. Secondly, on account of the strict economy, or rather even parsimony which has been observed by this Government in the years past—as a matter of fact it is the Government of India and the people of India as a whole that have been benefited by the parsimony and not this Presidency—a considerable amount of administrative measures of progress is in arrear; so that it is only by economising as far as we can that we can get money for the development of the departments that I referred to and other departments. It is specifically stated in the first Reform Report to the Secretary of State from the Government of India that the lion's share—in fact that is the word used in the despatch itself—of all the available resources and surplus funds should be handed over to the Ministers for the purpose of developing the transferred departments.

"The most important departments that produce revenue are the Land Revenue Department and the Excise Department. With reference to the Land Revenue Department, I doubt very much whether any great increase of revenue is possible therefrom. With reference to the Excise Department, the Hon'ble Mr. Todhunter stated the other day, probably rightly, that the limit of expansion of the revenue from that department has already been reached. With reference to the revenue that is derived from this department, I may say, Sir, that certainly it is the object of all of us, including the official and non-official members of this Council that drink should be discouraged as far as possible; but, in spite of our best efforts, man persists in drinking and so long as he does so, I think there is no reason why the Government should not make some money out of the drinking habit of the people. I wish to submit, Sir, that more money is necessary for departments like Education and Agriculture. A sum of 157 lakhs of rupees has been allotted for Education. I think, Sir, that looking into the importance of education as a whole, this amount of 157 lakhs is quite inadequate for the purpose. I shall try within the brief space of time that is allotted to me to show how further amounts can be found for this and other departments which, in my opinion, require more money. Out of this 157 lakhs, the amount that is allotted for secondary education is only about 27 lakhs. Of course, everybody admits that primary education is important. The goal to be reached is universal literacy. What I submit is that, in the present state of our country, secondary education is equally important. The future progress of the country depends, amongst other things, upon the growth of industries and the growth of industries in its turn

depends upon technical knowledge and for the acquisition of that kind of technical knowledge which is necessary for the development of industries, it is essential that our young men should have a good secondary education. For this purpose, collegiate education is unnecessary. It is not necessary that for the purpose of studying industrial subjects a man should have high collegiate qualifications. And primary education is certainly inadequate and insufficient for the purpose; so that it is only by spreading secondary education that the necessary training can be imparted to youths for the acquisition of skill in the industries. Therefore it seems to me that a very much larger amount than about 27 lakhs is necessary for secondary education.

"Then, Sir, with reference to Agriculture and Industries: with reference to Agriculture inclusive of Co-operation, the amount that is allotted in the budget is in round numbers only 31 lakhs. It seems to me that this is quite inadequate for the purpose. Both the Agricultural and Industrial departments have not been able to make any impression in the country, I mean that the people at large have not been materially benefited by the existence of these two departments. I do not blame anybody for that. With reference to agriculture in particul our ryots know sufficiently well the practical side of agriculture, but certa. they can be helped immensely by their being taught the scientific method agriculture. For this purpose it is essential that demonstration farms should opened in various parts of the country. In fact, everything depends upon t expenditure of money; so that it seems to me that this sum of 31 lakhs is quite inadequate for the purpose.

"Coming to Industries, the same observations that I made with reference to Agriculture can be applied to this department as well. The total amount that is allotted to this department is 23 lakhs of rupees, and 4 and odd lakhs out of this are exclusively set apart for the cinchona plantations, so that the amount that is really available is only about 18 and odd lakhs for the Industries proper. Of course, both in the Industrial Department and in the Agricultural Department a substantial portion of the amount goes as the pay of the officers. That, however, is inevitable; if we want to have competent officers, it is essential that they should be adequately paid. My point, however, is that a sum of 18 lakhs of rupees for industrial purposes is quite inadequate.

"Then, Sir, as I stated already, I shall submit certain observations for the purpose of showing how more funds can be obtained for those departments which require more money. It seems to me that from the budget, as it is framed, it is not at all difficult to obtain enough of funds from certain other departments without in any way injuring the efficiency or usefulness of those departments, for the purpose of these departments that I have already referred to. For instance, after going through the detailed figures given in the budget, I find that one item that runs through these figures from beginning to end is the amount allotted under 'Duty allowances'. I do not certainly object to the grant of duty allowances to petty officers. I find duty allowances to constables, to sub-inspectors, to police inspectors and other officers of similar status and rank. I have not taken into account duty allowances of Rs. 50 and below, but there are duty allowances of Rs. 200, Rs. 250 and so on per month. I have not added up the amounts appearing as duty allowances throughout the whole of the budget, but I have made some calculations here and there and I may say that these duty allowances come to several lakhs. I do not think that it is necessary that these highly-paid officers

should be given duty allowances in addition to their pay. So that, as I submitted, without any injury to the efficiency of those departments manned by those officers who are receiving duty allowances, we may cut off these allowances and utilize them for the development of those departments which stand in urgent need of money."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—" May I ask the Honourable Member to give us an example ? "

Diwan Bahadur M. KRISHNAN NAYAR :—" I am prepared to give. I may say at once that I may be wrong in my conclusion, that I may be wrong in my inference, but I shall take care that I am not wrong in my facts. For instance, at page 39 of the Preliminary Edition of the Budget, a sum of Rs. 250 per month or Rs. 3,000 per annum is given as duty allowance ; in page 52 a sum of Rs. 200 per month or Rs. 2,400 is allowed for the Personal Assistant to the Chief Conservator."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—" May I take it that the Honourable Member's contention is that these officers holding special appointments should draw their grade pay ? "

Diwan Bahadur M. KRISHNAN NAYAR :—" That is exactly my submission.

" Another item under which a large amount of reduction can be made is that under ' Lump provisions ' allotted for particular departments. Here again I find from beginning to end of this Budget that provision is made for lump allotments. In some of these, there are indications as to what these allotments are intended for. I do not object to them. It is only to the other kind of lump allotments for which clear explanations are not given, that I take exception. As an instance of a case in which clear explanations are not given, we may refer to page 52 of the Preliminary Budget. Here a sum of Rs. 80,000 is allotted under ' Lump provision on account of the scheme for the formation of two additional circles.' There are many other items which I take exception to. In page 51 under ' Other works ' a sum of Rs. 1,24,000 is given. I tried to get an idea of that. It is absolutely impossible to know what those ' other works ' are, for which this sum is intended. If details are given we may be satisfied. Again, at page 45 there is a sum of Rs. 1,27,000 allotted as ' Lump provision on account of revision of pay of the officers of the Excise Department '. At page 51 under ' Forest ' a sum of Rs. 2,16,000 is allotted as ' lump provision on account of the Russellkonda Saw Mill Scheme '. As I understand it, Sir, these lump allotments are made when definite, detailed and digested ideas have not been formed regarding the particular purpose for which the money is to be applied."

The Hon'ble Sir LIONEL DAVIDSON :—" May I at once say, Sir, that the lump allotment is based on the estimated exact cost of machinery purchased."

Diwan Bahadur M. KRISHNAN NAYAR :—" If these details had been given in the Budget I would have taken no objection. But that does not in any way deter the force of the general remarks which I made. As I already submitted, Sir, these lump allotments are generally made when definite ideas have not been formed about the application of the money."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—" May I call the Honourable Member's attention to rule 37 (*g*) (iii) of the Devolution Rules, wherein it is laid down that ' the Finance Department shall examine and advise on all schemes of new expenditure for which it is proposed to make provision in the estimates, and shall

decline to provide in the estimates for any scheme which has not been so examined'? I venture to say, Sir, that the Finance Department has insisted on compliance with this rule."

Diwan Bahadur M. KRISHNAN NAYAR:—"Then I ask where was the objection for showing the details for which the money was intended? We find thousands of items scattered throughout the Budget and with regard to small amounts like Rs. 200 and Rs. 300 details are given, but with regard to large amounts we find no details. I certainly accept the Honourable Member's remark as correct. But if the Finance Department had bestowed great care upon these, there was no reason why details should not have been given with reference to all these items.

"Another head from which large amounts can be taken away for the purpose of the Development Department is that under the Public Works Department. My objections come under two classes. In the first place I find that in several instances large amounts are provided for without apparently any estimates being prepared for the works. With reference to many of these for which estimates have not been prepared, works have already been started and probably it is now highly inconvenient to stop those works on which the amounts have been partially spent; but there are other works still, for which estimates have not been prepared and for which it is proposed to spend large amounts. Then, another class of works to which I take objection is this. I think it is unnecessary to provide costly buildings in Madras or in the mufassal for highly-paid officers such as district officers. I find that large provisions are made for constructing buildings for subordinate officers like constables, sub-inspectors, police inspectors and officers of their status in other departments. I have no objection whatever to render them this assistance. But with reference to other officers like the collectors, district superintendents of police and other gazetted officers, I think that they must be left to depend upon themselves. In page 2 of the preliminary issue of the Budget Estimates of the Public Works Department, the amounts of the estimates are given, as well as the amounts that are proposed to be allotted in 1921-22. Against many of these items blank square brackets are inserted and in some cases within the square brackets some figures are inserted; and there is this note of the Hon'ble the Finance Member about these rectangular brackets: 'the amounts indicate the approximate cost'. There are many other items in which square brackets are given without any figure and I take it that in these cases the estimates have not been prepared."

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT:—"The Honourable Member has already exceeded his time. But I am willing that the Honourable Member should have a chance of finishing his speech."

Diwan Bahadur M. KRISHNAN NAYAR (*continuing*):—"'Constructing residence for the Collector at Coimbatore,' apparently no estimate is prepared for this and Rs. 40,000 is proposed to be allotted for this work this year. Then again for official residences of gazetted officers at Madras, apparently no estimate has been prepared and it is proposed to allot two lakhs of rupees this year for that purpose. Then again, 'acquisition of a site for official residences in Coimbatore'; apparently no clear idea whatever has been formed about this, because the column is empty, and it is proposed to allot several lakhs for this work. Sir, all these amounts will certainly be useful, if set free, for other departments which require funds.

8th March 1921] [Mr. M. Krishnan Nayar]

"With reference to the appointment of officers. Here again, Sir, I find in an answer to a question put to-day by Mr. Richmond 'to ask the Hon'ble Member for Finance to state the cost of the different services before and after the recent grant of enhanced salaries to public officials down to and including village servants' the reply is this :—

	1917-18.	1921-22.
Imperial	59·05	94·09
Provincial	40·02	55·06

"In the case of subordinate officers and others it is certainy desirable that their salaries should have been enhanced. But in many instances, the salaries of high officers have been enhanced, and I find it difficult, and the Government themselves will find it difficult, to reduce the salaries which have once been granted. To do so, it will be unfair to the officers themselves.

"What I submit, Sir, is this. Let us not, during this financial stringency, during this period of urgency for money for other purposes, grant enhanced salaries to officers who are already in receipt of decent salaries, and let us also not create new posts which are not very urgently needed. Of course, exceptions must be made. I can very well understand and appreciate the difficulties of Government. It is only those who wear the shoe that know where it pinches. Barring such exceptions, let us not create new posts especially new posts carrying high salaries. For instance, I find that it is intended to create an additional Deputy Director and a Deputy Directress of Public Instruction on very high salaries (vide page 138 of the Budget Estimate). I do not think, Sir, that these are necessary. There is already one Director of Public Instruction and one Deputy Director of Public Instruction and it is proposed to create another additional Deputy Director (temporary) (Indian Educational Service) at a cost of Rs. 6,600 and one Deputy Directress (temporary) (Indian Educational Service) at a cost of Rs. 11,100."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER (*interrupting*) :—"These are all existing appointments. The whole thing is shown in one figure for the previous year."

Diwan Bahadur M. KRISHNAN NAYAR (*continuing*) :—"I beg my Honourable friend's pardon, Sir. If they are not new appointments, I do not understand the meaning of the columns (on page 138)—the first column is 'Salaries', the second column is 'Numbers'. This second column is divided into two sub-columns, viz., 1920-21 and 1921-22. Under this column of 1920-21 we find a blank and under 1921-22 we find 'one additional Deputy Director'; but in the case of the Director we find both the columns 1920-21 and 1921-22 filled. I don't see what this means if it does not mean that the blank denotes that there was no appointment in 1921-22. So that, Sir, let us not create new posts carrying high salaries and let us not enhance the salaries of those who are already in receipt of handsome salaries. In these and other various ways enough of funds can be got without in any way interfering with the efficiency and usefulness of other departments by letting free funds for the use of the Development departments. I have much more to say, Sir, but you have already been very indulgent to me, and I don't want to abuse your generosity."

Mr. C. V. S. NARASIMHA RAJU :—"Mr. President, the interval between the presentation of the budget and the debate is very short and the discussion on and criticism of the budget is rendered more difficult by the manner in which the budget is presented this year. Hitherto, when presenting the budget, the Finance Secretary used to give us a memorandum and in the memorandum we

used to find various items explaining either the increase of revenue or the increase of expenditure. In the absence of such a memorandum by the Chief Secretary, the Hon'ble the Finance Member might have given us a detailed account of all the variations. Instead of doing that, he gave us a history of the development of the resources for thirty years and the development of expenditure for thirty years and so on. It is very difficult for us on the materials before us now to criticise the budget. His review may serve some other purpose but it does not serve the purpose of assisting us in obtaining clear and perspective view of the whole budget as presented by him. On account of these difficulties, I hope the Hon'ble the Finance Member will see his way to explain the difficulties that may be complained of by me and my colleagues.

"Sir, the growth of revenue in 1921-22, as compared with that of 1919-20, or the growth of expenditure in the coming year, as compared with that of 1920, is more than 3 crores. To make my statement clear, I shall give a few figures. According to the budget estimate of 1921-22, the expenditure is 1,702 lakhs; out of this we have to deduct 384 lakhs and odd to be given as contribution to the Government of India; 22 and odd lakhs expenditure in England which mostly consists of pensions, a new burden now thrown upon the Province. Again, Sir, there is an increase of 43 lakhs in interest on account of the abolition of divided heads. This is the amount which this Province has to incur on account of capital expenditure on irrigation works. Again, Sir, there is a matter of 20 lakhs on account of expenditure from revenue under irrigation works. The whole of this comes to about 469 lakhs. After deducting this, we are left with a balance of 1,232 lakhs. The expenditure for the year 1920 is 954 lakhs and odd, or in round figures 955 lakhs. Out of this we have to deduct the savings on account of the Political Department which was a burden hitherto borne by this Province but now taken away from it and which comes nearly to 1 lakh and odd. There is a reduction in capital expenditure from Revenue. In 1919 the capital expenditure on irrigation works from Revenue was Rs. 1,96,000, whereas under the budget estimate it is Rs. 72,000. This is a great reduction. Then there is a saving of Rs. 1,25,000. If we add up all these items, they come to 952 lakhs. Thus there will be a balance of 278 lakhs for expenditure. The whole of this is the growth of expenditure within the last two years. There is a similar growth of revenue when compared with the revenue of 1919-20. Of course we have to take into consideration the deficit of 30 lakhs with which the budget is presented this year. Now it is necessary to examine how this whole amount of 278 lakhs is proposed to be utilized. As far as I can gather, most of it is under Revenue, Excise and various other departments, and the main feature of all the expenditure is, increase in salaries and allowances, such as travelling allowances, deputation allowances and other things. Sir, when there is so much increase of revenue, is it not right that we should expect the Government to devote a major portion of it or at least half of it to purposes conducive to the material and moral progress of the country? Here again, Sir, if we compare the budget proposals of previous years with the proposal of this year, the result is most disappointing. In the wake of past criticisms by non-officials there used to be some new departure every year by way of utilization of funds for increased expenditure under medical relief, sanitation, education and so on. This year we hardly find any increased expenditure on University education. Sir, as regards the contribution towards University education, if we compare the figures for next year with those of 1920-21 we see a reduction of nearly two lakhs and odd. In the matter of secondary education, I do not find any increase at all, and the increase if any is to be found in increased salaries of the staff. Again in

8th March 1921] [Mr. C. V. S. Narasimha Raju]

the matter of primary education, we do not find any increase. In the year 1913 this Government committed itself to a policy of devoting a progressive grant of two lakhs to education and every year it has become customary to utilise half of it for the expansion of elementary education. Sir, we do not find any provision for any of these purposes in the budget of this year. I know a provision of six lakhs is made for elementary education, but that is only for the constitution of Educational Councils. Here it may be noted that the main purpose of the Educational Councils is to distribute the educational grants among the various private bodies. The grant itself is 26 lakhs and to distribute it new Councils are to come into existence costing nearly six lakhs a year. Sir, again, in the matter of medical relief we do not find any policy of extending medical relief. All the extra items in the medical grant are only for increased salaries of officers and subordinates and so on.

"We expected, that with the abolition of the divided heads a greater revenue would fall to the share of this Province to be utilised for the amelioration of the backward classes and of the masses. We find instead that the whole endeavour of the Government has been to ameliorate the condition of their own subordinates and servants. Sir, is it right or just that a sum of two crores and odd should be wholly utilized for the amelioration of the services, leaving aside all other possible developments of the country? Is it the policy of the Government that all the existing sources of revenue should be utilized for the payment of increased salaries to their servants and that the future Development Ministers should be left to tap new resources? Is it the policy of the Government that the Ministers of this new Council should sit with hands tied, so that greater discontentment will be created and that the expectations of the agitators of the school of non-co-operation now ranging all over the country realized? If the voters in the last election had any mandate for their representatives, it was not to enhance the taxation; and when the voiceless millions of electors are sending their representatives to this Council, are the Ministers and the representatives to sit with tied hands so as not to make any development, or are they to incur the displeasure of their electors and the penalty of being turned out from this Council? Sir, I think there is a deep-seated desire on the part of the executive in this matter to test the electorate as well as the Council. Here I may point out that last year without knowing what our future resources would be this Government had exhausted the balances to the extent of 157 lakhs and odd by an overdraft on the balances. What did they do the other day? They utilized it in the enhancement of the salaries of their servants. Not a pie went to the social improvement of the masses. Again, Sir, in pursuance of the same policy they are now about to increase their commitment by another 50 or 60 lakhs, if I understand properly the budget proposals, in the shape of increased salaries for their subordinates.

"The increase in expenditure under the Revenue head is 59 lakhs, under Excise 9 lakhs and odd, under Registration 5 lakhs and odd, under Administration of Justice 25 lakhs and under Police 45 lakhs. All this amount is to go towards increase of salaries. Sir, if we take into consideration the other services which are very expensive and which have been committed to the care and attention of the elected representatives in the Cabinet, we find that nothing is left to shape any policy. In order to explain this the Hon'ble the Finance Member said at the beginning of his memorandum that the new Ministers were quite new to their departments and did not want to deviate from the existing policy. Here again I don't think it is a compliment to my friends. I think any Indian would strongly resent these remarks. Sir, if they don't want to deviate from the existing policy, have they made up their mind to stick up to the existing policy? That is my

question. In the matter of Local Self-Government we were in the habit of receiving doles. That has been stopped. Is that deviation from previous policy or a continuance of that policy? As far as expenditure is concerned they ought to deviate from the previous policy, and if non-development is their motto they may stick to the existing policy. Am I to understand the latter to be the spirit of the Government?"

Mr. A. Ramaswami Mudaliyar (*interrupting*):—"May I point out that the Hon'ble the Finance Member said that the present Government 'had no intention of commencing their term of office by making radical changes and disturbing the continuity of policy'. I should like to emphasise these two words, 'radical' and 'continuity'."

Mr. C. V. S. Narasimha Raju (*continuing*):—"Yes, Sir, I am now stating that the present Government has deviated from the existing practice. They are not continuing the existing policy. I think I am correct in stating that. The words are these: 'by making radical changes and disturbing the continuity of the policy.' What is the policy which the Government followed in regard to financing local bodies? For maintenance of roads, for construction of bridges, for the construction of minor sanitary works year after year, doles were given by the Provincial Government. All on a sudden the whole of this was stopped under cover of the recommendations of the Financial Relations Committee. So there is a change of policy so far as saving of revenue is concerned."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. Ramarayaningar (*interrupting*):—"May I say a word of explanation, Sir? The fact is that the Financial Relations Committee was appointed under the orders of the late Government and not under the orders of the present Government. What the Finance Member meant was that we do not propose to adopt a radical change in the policy adopted by the Government hitherto."

Mr. C. V. S. Narasimha Raju (*continuing*):—"Sir, If I understand the policy of Government from the financial figures of the budget for 1920–21 or of the budget figures for 1919–20 and if we compare those figures with the present figures, I do find that there is a great change in the matter of development, and I am referring to that.

"Now I want to refer to the loan business. It is proposed that a sum of 70 lakhs is to be raised as a loan, and the real amount that is to be got as loan is only 60·50 lakhs because 9·50 lakhs is the amount which this Government has to pay to the Government of India. Again, it is to be noted that out of 60½ lakhs which is the real loan to be raised, Rs. 3,91,000 goes to increase the balances, 30·34 lakhs is to recoup the deficit, 11·28 lakhs is intended for expenditure on irrigation works on Capital account and 15 lakhs is proposed to be lent on Provincial Loan account to municipalities and other bodies. Thus the sum of 9½ lakhs that has now to be paid to the Government of India and which has to be recovered on account of the Provincial Loan account in the past is to be absorbed in the general revenues. Am I correct, Sir?"

The Hon'ble the President:—"The Honourable Member is near the end of his time."

Mr. C. V. S. Narasimha Raju (*continuing*):—"I am quite aware of it, Sir.

"Now, in this connexion we see from Appendix B in the Memorandum that the construction of buildings is to be financed in two ways, one from the general revenues and the other from the loan account. I am not able to discriminate

between the various items in the appendix. Take for instance the first item, 'Quarters for the District Forest Officer, Cuddapah'. That has to be met from revenues. The second item 'Quarters for the Conservator at Salem' is to be met from loan account. Both are quarters for officers, and I am not able to understand why one is to be met from the revenue and the other from loan. If you examine in the same light the other items you will not be able to trace any policy why this is to be financed from revenue and the other from loan. Sir, was there any underlying principle in putting down the various debits, from revenue or loan, or was it put down without any defined policy of the Government? The growth of revenue from land revenue, as compared with that of last year, is 32 lakhs and under Excise it is 15 lakhs; the total is 47 lakhs. The whole of this money comes from the masses and not a single pie is to go back to them for ameliorating their condition and the revenue expenditure is very heavy. The land revenue itself is 620 lakhs. The expenditure under this head is 200 lakhs. Now to spend 200 lakhs in all the departments in order to obtain a revenue of 620 lakhs seems very extraordinary. If we compare the figures for Excise we shall see that the Excise revenue is 556 lakhs, whereas the expenditure is only 33 lakhs. There is no proportion between the expenditure under Land Revenue and that under Excise expenditure. The enormous growth of expenditure does require retrenchment and it was stated in the memorandum that under the personal supervision of His Excellency retrenchment would be worked out, but if I understand it aright, it is only the retrenchment of a number of peons, clerks and other petty things and not any great retrenchment that will really improve the resources of the country. Of course it was stated at the end of the memorandum that the Provincial Government as well as the local bodies must try to improve the resources in the years to come. The Finance Member himself has stated that the Excise revenue has reached the maximum level, and it is the general feeling of the country that the land revenue has already reached an oppressive standard and any further progress in that direction must be made very cautiously. With these remarks, I feel constrained to say that the budget is very very unsatisfactory."

Mr. T. A. RAMALINGA CHETTIYAR:—" Mr. President, Sir, the Hon'ble the Finance Member himself has stated in his memorandum that the budget is not likely to meet with the approval of the Members. When one comes to know of all the provisions made in the budget it will be seen,—and I for one have no doubt,—that that remark is quite correct. At the end of his memorandum the Hon'ble the Finance Member has stated that there are various directions in which rapid improvement is called for and for which provision is not made. He says there are only two ways of meeting the situation. There again he is quite correct. One is retrenchment of expenditure incurred and the other is investigating the resources from which additional funds can be raised. But I do not know, Mr. President, whether he is quite serious in mentioning the first method by which he expects much relief for making the very necessary improvements. In paragraph 35 of the memorandum it is stated: 'I have referred above to the reduction by 15 per cent in the strength of the police. Other instances might be cited in the reduction in the number of peons (chiefly among personal attendants on officers) and of clerks in the Settlement department of the Board of Revenue.' These are the retrenchments that, after an investigation, the Government have found possible to effect last year. We are seriously told that the other departments are being examined and scrutinized with a view to effect retrenchment in them. If the result is going to be anything like what was obtained last year, I beg to submit, Mr. President, the statement is one conceived in irony and not with a view to any seriousness. It is

also said that His Excellency the Governor is making an inquiry under his personal supervision. We are extremely glad that His Excellency the Governor is interesting himself in this matter. But at the same time some of us do feel that many of the appointments that have been made have been made with the concurrence of the Governor; and if the same gentleman who sanctioned these appointments is to sit in judgment with regard to them, we do not know whether that sort of unprejudiced consideration in the matter can be had as we can have in the case of a committee appointed by this Council or some other committee which will be independent of the actions that have been done during the past years. I may state, Mr. President, that the feeling is very strong in the country that in the last two or three years the Government have been going on in a very extravagant manner. Appointments have been made one after another without reference to the necessities of the services or to the capacity of the people to bear the expenditure involved. Salaries of appointments have been increased without reference to any of these things. I will only instance one or two appointments with reference to which some opinion had been expressed. For example, the Commissioner of Labour and his assistants have been employed recently. No doubt that department is an important one and probably ought to have come earlier. But then it ought to come when there is work for it and not when there is no work for it. For the present year there is a provision of a lakh and a half rupees for the betterment of the depressed classes. The expenditure to be incurred by this department of the Commissioner of Labour is out of all proportion to the expenditure incurred on it. Certainly we can have provision made for the services of the Commissioner of Labour and his assistants by entrusting their duties to other officers. We can add the cost of the department to the grant that is given for the betterment of the depressed classes and have the work done by the ordinary agency. In that way the depressed classes will be very much bettered than by the appointment of the special Commissioner of Labour and his assistants. In my humble opinion, Sir, this sort of making appointments without work and then simply finding for them work which was not originally intended for them is not a policy which ought to be encouraged. At any rate, in the present state of the country we cannot afford it. Then, Sir, the Hon'ble the Finance Member has stated that the only other resource is additional taxation. Here again, there is in the statement made by the Government a fallacy. They always compare our taxation with the taxation in western countries. They say that the proportion of taxation to income in western countries is very high whereas in India it is very low. True, I admit that. But, then, Sir, it is not considered what the incomes of the people in the different countries are. Mr. Slater, a Member of this Council, made investigations quite recently and his figures are the highest so far as the income is concerned. Even he stated that five pounds a year is the average income per head of the population in India. But as a matter of fact, a learned Doctor of the Bombay Presidency, the Principal of the Agricultural College and a gentleman who has had much to do with the people made inquiries in the Deccan and he came to the conclusion that about Rs. 24 or Rs. 26 would be the average income per head of the population in India. Dr. Slater himself admits that the Government made a calculation some time back and found that two pounds per head would be the average income per head in India. If that is the case, I beg to submit, Mr. President, people have to be allowed something just to live before they can pay any taxes. There is some margin beyond which alone any tax can be raised. I do not think it can be said that a man who is able to have only one meal in two days ought to be prepared to pay half his income because a man in England probably who lives in a palatial house is able to pay half

his income to Government. There ought to be some sort of allowance made for people in the condition in which they are in India. To argue on the analogy of England and other western countries that the proportion of taxation in India should be what it obtains in the western countries, I beg to submit, is a proposition which is made without due consideration of the conditions of the countries.

"And then, Mr. President, it is also said that the local bodies have not exhausted their capacity for taxation. Here again, there is the Elementary Education Act not yet come to force. Under that, three pies in the rupee are allowed to be raised as taxation for educational purposes in the district. In a district like Coimbatore the tax comes to about Rs. 55,000. The Government may pay an addition of Rs. 55,000. The total will be about Rs. 1,10,000. Is it seriously to be supposed that with this amount of Rs. 1,10,000 we will be able to provide all that is necessary for primary education or is it seriously expected that we will be able to have free compulsory primary education out of this fund? This is absolutely impossible. We want several lakhs of rupees if we are going to have free primary education in a big district like Coimbatore. So I beg to submit, Mr. President, that the mere statement that we will have to exhaust the resources before we can do anything is a proposal which will not satisfy this House; because the exhaustion of these resources will not give us anything like what we want.

"In my humble opinion, Mr. President, the chief sources for the funds that are necessary ought to come from retrenchment. As I already submitted there are various departments with practically no work whatever."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. Todhunter:—"May I ask the Honourable Member to give instances of that very strong statement that there are departments which have no work."

Mr. T. A. Ramalinga Chettiyar:—"I did not say no work, but very little work."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. Todhunter:—"May I ask instances of that, Sir?"

Mr. T. A. Ramalinga Chettiyar:—"I have given instances. There are other departments which are run on a very extravagant scale. I will give for illustration Public Works Department. The same sort of work is being done without so large an establishment by the local boards. Now under the Local Fund Code we are asked not to exceed twenty per cent of the expenditure on public works on the establishment and as a matter of fact I believe the expenditure works out to 13 or 14 per cent. But if you take the Public Works Department which is doing the same work, we find from the accounts taken two years back that it comes to about 40 per cent. Even according to the present budget what is provided is something like 30 per cent provided all the expenditure that is budgeted is to be incurred in the year. We know that several works started last year have not yet been finished. Taking this fact into consideration, the amount that will be spent this year will be very much less than the budgeted amount. There are some items in the budget, for instance acquisition of sites and houses, with which the Public Works Department has nothing to do. There are some very big items, for instance Rs. 3,00,000 for the acquisition of buildings for the Queen Mary's College, Rs. 2,00,000 for acquisition of a site for official residences, Coimbatore, Rs. 1 lakh and odd for acquisition of sites in Ootacamund, Trichinopoly and Madura and so on. If we leave out these things, the expenditure on the establishment will come to over 30 per cent of the expenditure that is going to be incurred in the department. Mr. President, this is a matter which requires consideration. The local funds are

doing the same work and they incur an expenditure of 13 or 14 per cent, whereas the Public Works Department at the lowest computation is spending from 30 to 40 per cent. This is a very unsatisfactory state of things. It shows clearly enough that the Government is managing its affairs on a very extravagant scale. So far as the Public Works Department is concerned, a committee sat a few years back and recommended that wherever possible the district board agency might be utilized by the Public Works Department and those offices of the Public Works Department which have not much work might be abolished. That is a matter which requires careful investigation and in view of the fact that a very large part of the expenditure in the Public Works Department is being wasted, I should earnestly request the consideration of the Council for an investigation in this matter of handing over the Public Works Department works to the district board engineering establishment and getting the work done through them. So far as I can see, there does not seem to be much objection to the course. Estimates can go to the Superintending Engineer for sanction after being prepared by the local fund establishment. The works themselves can be inspected now and then by the Superintending Engineer; and any big work may be actually inspected by him before final bills are passed. I do not think there will be any serious inconvenience in the way of the proposal to have these Public Works Department works carried out by the district board establishment. I know there is one objection raised with regard to this requiring consideration and that is with regard to the irrigation works. In some areas where we have got irrigation works on a large scale this may not be possible—for instance, Gōdāvari, Kistna and Tanjore, where we can have separate Irrigation Engineers. I do not think this will be an insuperable objection. Then, Sir, there is another aspect for our consideration. In several of the departments there is a proposal made to incur larger expenditure not only by way of increasing the salaries that are actually given to the services, for instance, raising the salaries of the services, but also of changing the officers from one service to another. In the field of education we used to have some Inspectors in the Provincial service and some in the Imperial service. Now what is proposed to be done is this: instead of 13 Inspectors of whom 7 were in the Imperial service and 6 in the provincial, all the 13 Inspectors will be in the Indian Educational Service. Three additional Inspectors are going to be appointed making the total number of Inspectors 16, all in the Indian Educational Service. Thus there is an increase in the number as well as in pay. I cannot really see what necessity there is for an increase in both ways. I was under the impression that the policy was to have Inspectors, practically one Inspector on an average for each district, and then the Assistant Inspectors would go. But as a matter of fact the 13 Assistant Inspectors are retained. Thus there is no reduction at all in the establishment, but on the other hand there is an increase in the establishment and also increase in the pay. I cannot for a moment see why all these Inspectors ought to be put in the Indian Educational Service. Indian Educational Service means a pay of Rs. 400 to start with and rising on to 1,750. But Provincial Educational Service means a pay of Rs. 250 to start with and rising on to Rs. 800. I do not know whether there is any necessity for putting all these men in the Indian Educational Service. As a matter of fact, these Inspectors have to come into close contact with the people. Their work is mainly to supervise primary education and also where necessary middle school education. In these cases they will have to be in touch with the people and they will have to know the customs and manners of the people and therefore they will have to be mostly, if not wholly, Indians. Otherwise they will not be able to do their work satisfactorily. If at all there was any necessity for a change it was for changing

the men in the Indian Educational Service to the Provincial Educational Service. Instead of that we find that all the men in the Provincial Educational Service are changed into the Indian Educational Service. It looks to me a most unjustifiable arrangement that is now proposed and I very strongly object to it. There are several other cases in which similar arrangements are proposed. I give this only as an illustration.

"Then, Sir, my learned friend Mr. Krishnan Nayar referred to duty allowances. I find that it is not only the duty allowances but all sorts of allowances are given. These are local allowance, personal allowance temporary allowance, hill allowance and any number of other allowances. When salaries have been raised out of all proportion, it seems to me a very unjustifiable act on the part of the executive to sanction also all sorts of these allowances. I took only one department this morning, the Forest department, because it was the smallest department. So far as the allowances are concerned they are as follows. We have got duty allowances for the Principal, Madras Forest College, the Personal Assistant to the Conservator, Extra Assistant Conservators in major districts, Extra Assistant Conservator, Parlakimedi Maliahs, Typists, Head clerks of District Forest Officers and so on. Then again we have personal allowances to Rangers, Foresters, Establishments of the Chief Conservator, District Forest Office establishment, temporary establishment for Golgonda Agency and Revenue Inspectors. A Revenue Inspector is given a local allowance and a temporary allowance is given for a Ranger. Then again the other complaint is about the lump provisions. The Forest Department is a department from which we do expect some return. It is not one of the administrative departments which are necessary for their own sake. Now what do we find? We find a very large expenditure is incurred and the return does not fully cover the expenditure incurred. All the same proposals are made for increase in the service and increase in the number of officers. Then we are also told that for Wynad and local allowances a provision of Rs. 10,000 is made.

"I beg to submit, Sir, all these only show that the provisions are made without any idea of proportion as to the requirements. On the other hand, if we see those services for which admittedly there are large demands for improvement, what do we find? This is my analysis of a few items: I took up education for analysis in this case. For University education 1·2 lakhs are provided in excess of last year's amount; all that goes to salaries. There is nothing now provided for. For Secondary Education (Reserved) 4·13 lakhs extra are provided. That is swallowed up by Lawrence School and something extra is provided for boarding grants. Then we come to the transferred head and there we find 3 lakhs and odd extra. There I find the only provision that is possibly made is for one or two girls' schools. For I find in the provision for Headmistresses, mistresses and teachers, there is an increase; so I presume that the provision of 3 lakhs extra is intended for the opening of additional girls' schools. It is not known how many schools will be opened. Then as regards Primary education, there is an additional provision of about 8·7 lakhs. That is to be spent like this: Capitation allowance is 3 lakhs. That is only another form of grant that is usually given. Then for Panchama education a provision of one lakh is made. That is certainly a desirable improvement, though a larger amount ought to have been provided for it. For bringing the Education Act into force, they have made a provision of six lakhs. Out of these six lakhs, a lakh or a lakh and a half will, I think, be naturally spent for office establishment and probably more, if we go on the scale on which other arrangements are made. Then what is left is only 4 or 5 lakhs. That will be for bringing this Education Act into operation over the whole Presidency. I beg to submit, Sir, whether the

Council seriously thinks that this additional provision is sufficient for the improvement of primary education when we have been agitating for it so long. We have been saying that every boy ought to be given a chance and ought to be educated. That has been the cry everywhere. Now we are seriously making a provision of six lakhs which includes provision for district educational councils and for the improvement of primary education. In all seriousness I ask, 'are we serious here'? I do not think it looks as if we are serious."

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT :—"The Honourable Member has exceeded his time-limit by more than five minutes."

Mr. T. A. RAMALINGA CHETTIYAR :—"Then we have got only two other heads. They are, Special Education and General charges, under which also I do not see any provision is made for any sort of improvement.

"So, I beg to submit, Sir, that it is a matter for consideration whether, in considering this budget, the income is properly distributed under the various heads. To my mind we have not done so. We have only paid the officers high and low and we have also done it in a way which does not meet with much approval of the outside public.

"There is one other matter I will refer to and I will close. Even the salaries as we used to pay have been very much commented upon in old days. They were put up very high, out of all proportion, and higher than the capacity of the country to pay. They were much more than what was being paid to officers in the same position in other countries. Two or three years ago Mrs. Besant issued a leaflet showing one reason why India wanted Home Rule. She gave a list of higher appointments in other countries and in India. She showed that we were paying here out of all proportion more than what was being paid to officers who have much greater responsibilities elsewhere. I have the leaflet here and it may take some time to read it. I do not want to take up very much time however. . . ."

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT :—"The Honourable Member has gone far beyond his time-limit and he proposes to read in extenso from Mrs. Besant's pamphlet. I understood that the Honourable Member was going to wind up. I will allow a few more minutes and I do hope that he will use them for winding up."

Mr. T. A. RAMALINGA CHETTIYAR :—"Mr. President, I only want to say that the scale of pay that was being paid here in our country was out of all proportion to our capacity and requirements. Even when there was already this cry of high salaries all round, I beg to submit, the present proposals go much further than what Mrs. Besant then said to be a reason for asking Home Rule. This is a budget which requires careful scrutiny especially with regard to the increased salaries and the large number of new appointments. If anything could be done at all in the direction in which the Hon'ble the Finance Member wanted to help us, the only proper course for him will be to propose a committee of this House to go into the question in detail and propose ways and means and not to ask us to satisfy ourselves with the promise that His Excellency the Governor will do the needful. Not that I have not got any regard for His Excellency. I have the greatest regard for him and I have no doubt that he will do his best to help us. But at the same time having made the appointments himself, it is rather too much to expect him to take a detached view of the matter."

Mr. R. APPASWAMI NAYUDU :—"Mr. President, I rise to offer a few remarks on the budget which has been presented to this Council the other day by the Hon'ble Mr. Todhunter. It will be highly satisfactory if the budget had been

prepared in such a way as to allow a larger amount of money for such of the items which immediately concern the welfare of ryot population. Sir, as it is, the money proposed to be spent on transferred subjects is so meagre as to practically tie the hands of our Ministers from doing any substantial work on the lines of practical reforms. Our villagers who are the mainstay of our Government are neglected. The items which are most essential for the welfare of our ryots are not satisfactorily accounted for. Primary education, village roads, village sanitation and village panchayats are the essential things to which we should devote our attention and try to do our best. It is in the village that we must try to introduce these reforms. It is these villages that go to form our empire and without them there will be no exchequer. Sir, these villagers have been enfranchised and by the exercise of their franchise they are very anxious to see that their conditions are bettered and their village surroundings are improved. They want village schools to be established in their villages so as to educate their children to enable them at least to read and write. They want village roads in their surroundings so as to enable them to take their agricultural products to the nearest market to dispose of them and also to bring such necessary products for their own consumption. Sir, especially in rainy season in the black-cotton soils there are many instances where poor villagers have starved for many days without getting proper provision. Such are the plights these villagers are put to for want of proper roads especially in the rainy season. Then again there is sanitation in the villages which is not as satisfactory as it ought to be. With narrow lanes, with accumulation of filth and cattle dung and added to these with the sewage, the village forms itself an abiding ground for the germination of too numerous parasites which bring on epidemic of all forms and in such virulent types. It is high time that we should try to avoid such catastrophes overtaking the villagers by sufficient sanitary arrangements so as to make them immune from the dire ravages of these epidemics. Then again we should institute a panchayat in each village so that disputes between a ryot and another may be settled without recourse to costly litigation in law courts. Sir, these are the essential points to which we should draw our attention and which we should introduce without any delay.

"There are still higher reforms to be introduced in the villages. Agricultural reforms, industrial development and irrigation works are the most essential things for the welfare of the agricultural population. Sir, both the Government as well as the ryots are benefited by adopting such measures of improvements. Sir, it ought to be the duty of every responsible Government to see that the agricultural population who are committed to their care live most contentedly and prosperously. It is they who subscribe most of the revenue which goes to the coffers of Government, and as such, it must be our duty to protect their interests more than that of anybody else. Sir, in their contentment and prosperity lies the strength of the Government. The Government should try to help these poor ryots even at the cost of sacrificing some of the higher reforms. The usual plea of want of money should not be brought in but they should try to procure money anyhow even by retrenching some of the minor items. Money must be forthcoming at any rate even without further taxation. Sir, we have had enough of taxation in the land and anything more even to the slightest degree will break the neck of our poor ryots and I fear will upset the orderly form of Government. Sir, with empty exchequer on one side and with reforms looming large on the other side we are placed in a very sad predicament. Sir, our legitimate money, a portion of our money which is very useful for the carrying on of our reforms is, by one stroke of the pen—I refer to the Meston award—snatched away by the Central Government amidst loud protestations of the people and the Government alike. Only the other

day the Hon'ble the Finance Member was kind enough to call the claim of the non-gazetted officers as daylight dacoity. Now what will he call this? Really we are very cruelly treated by the Central Government. It really passes my comprehension why of all the provinces this province alone was selected for such a bad treatment. Is it because that our Government had a large sum of unspent money in their hands that they were accorded such treatment? When they found surpluses in our hands they were kind enough to take them, but when they find a deficit and when they find that we want money for reforms it is but proper that they should grant us more money. At any rate we should try to get back our money from the Central Government. Without it we are unable to carry on the reforms and the object with which they were granted will be nullified and defeated. It is not for me to say anything in this House upon this subject, but it is for the joint heads of this House to deliberate and arrive at some conclusion on this important matter. This House consists of representatives mostly of the agricultural population and I impress on their minds that it is their bounden duty to bring these reforms to the villages.

"With these few remarks I appeal to the good sense of this House to use its discretion in deleting some of the items which ought not to find place in the budget and in subscribing more liberally to such of the items of the transferred subjects which immediately benefit our ryot population whom we have the honour to represent in this Council."

Diwan Bahadur D. Seshagiri Rao Pantulu:—"I quite appreciate the difficult circumstances under which this budget has been framed. The demands for expenditure are increasing in every direction whereas there is no corresponding increase in our sources of income. Excise which forms one of the two main sources of our income and upon which we cannot very conscientiously rely has, it is stated, reached its utmost point and I am afraid land revenue which is the next item of our resource has also reached its highest point. These high prices have made the poor clerks clamour for increase of salaries. They only want a living wage. The Salaries Committee has proposed Rs. 30 and Rs. 35 for these poor clerks in the mufussal and in the Presidency town, respectively, but I am afraid that nothing less than Rs. 40 and Rs. 45 may be considered reasonable for these poor clerks and the Hon'ble the Finance Member will have to adjust the budget accordingly.

"Then there is the question of the schoolmaster who is miserably paid. Then again there is the question of village officers—the munsif, the karnam and the village servants, talaiyaris. It is stated that the village munsif's appointment is an honorary one, but, so far as my knowledge goes, very few munsifs have been gratified at being called honorary men. They all want pay.

"Then again about education, the grants that have been made already in the budget to the various local boards are, I am afraid, insufficient. Then what are the various sources from which all these various items of demand can be met. I would suggest that non-productive works in the budget of the Public Works Department might be left out till we tide over these stringent times. Then again, as my Hon'ble friend Mr. Krishnan Nayar has stated, it must be considered whether the temporary appointments which have been created might not be discontinued in view of the pressure of the circumstances.

"Then I share the regret expressed by the sub-committee in the Government having decided upon the salaries of these highly-paid officers without first settling the claims of the non-gazetted officers of low pay. They had been clamouring for their pay for one or two years before the highly-paid officers were recommended for more liberal scale of salaries."

8th March 1921] [The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. Todhunter]

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—" I rise to a point of order. It is not a fact that the non-gazetted officers asked for an increase of pay before recommendations were made in the case of the gazetted officers."

Diwan Bahadur D. SESHAGIRI RAO PANTULU :—" I believe the Salaries Committee was appointed in 1919 to suggest measures for the enhancement of their salaries."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—" The reference on the subject of salaries recommended by the Public Services Commission was received in January 1917."

Diwan Bahadur D. SESHAGIRI RAO PANTULU :—" But whatever it is, the actual sanction of the highly liberal scales of salaries to the highly-paid officers was granted only a few months ago."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—" Again may I say, Sir, that there was a sum of Rs. 24,00,000 provided in the budget for last year ?"

Diwan Bahadur D. SESHAGIRI RAO PANTULU :—" We only know of the effect given to the proposals. Highly-paid officers are drawing liberal scale of salaries only for the last few months and if I say more they are even given a purse of 3,000 and 4,000 rupees for their pay with retrospective effect. All these circumstances are only exasperating the poor-paid clerk who sees that he is on the verge of starvation if he is not already starving. He sees that these highly-paid officers with a pay of hundreds to their credit are being given something more to add to their saving capacity. Under these circumstances, I appeal to the House whether it is not incumbent on the Government to see that these poor-paid clerks are duly provided for. They do the most important work, they do all the drudgery and if we have a discontended poor clerkdom if I can call it that will all be to the inefficiency of the administration.

" Again these reforms cost a good deal of money. I find that a sum of Rs. 1,20,000 is put down as travelling allowances for the Honourable Members. I hope that we, the non-official members of this House, will agree not to draw the double first class (hear, hear) which they are entitled to and show the way in which economy could be effected ; and then perhaps the Ministers will come forward in their own way and ask for a smaller pay (hear, hear). It is all very well for people to talk. Unless we show in a practical manner what we can do in our own humble way, I think there is no hope for reforms. Then, Sir, the complaint is that our administration is top-heavy. Our officers are more highly paid than in any other country and if you want to effect economy it is not by dispensing with a few peons here and a few peons there but by totally overhauling the question of pay to these highly-paid officers. Until the time comes when rice sells at 6 measures a rupee, I suggest that some 25 or 30 per cent may be added to the pay of the clerks whose income is less than Rs. 200. With regard to appointments which carry a salary of more than Rs. 200 I suggest that a strong committee to overhaul the whole subject may be appointed and the question be settled to the best satisfaction of all the people concerned. We have plenty to do by way of ameliorating the conditions of the masses and unless we observe strict economy, that is hopeless. Then there is a widespread discontent in the villages and if to that we also add the widespread discontent among the clerks and the school teachers and the village officers, I am afraid, it will redound to the discredit of the administration.

" It is stated to our very face that all these Legislative Councils will end in a mere farce and that we shall not be able to do anything in this Council. That is

the insult which they levelled to our very faces when we were seeking for election. If with all our combined energy and intelligence we should not be able to show one substantial step of reform, one thing to add to the convenience and comfort of the people, I am afraid we shall be strengthening the hands of our non-co-operators (hear, hear). I am glad of one thing and with this remark I beg to close my speech. When these poor electors who do not know how to read and write had to put in their thumb impressions the non-co-operators were busy in saying that they were putting their thumb marks as a token of their consent for increased taxation. I know of several cases where the poor people out of their regard for the candidate put their thumb impression and when they were told so they came out and actually wept that they put in their seal to the enhanced taxation and it is with very great satisfaction I find that the Hon'ble the Finance Member has not proposed any taxation (hear, hear) and has given the lie direct to the misrepresentations of these non-co-operators."

Rao Sahib U. RAMA RAO :—" The Hon'ble the Finance Member in paragraph 21 of his Memorandum says thus : 'Though there is still only one qualified medical practitioner for every 22,000 of the population they are many times more numerous than they were in 1891–92.' All the same, the amount of money that we are spending for hospitals, dispensaries and on medical establishments comes to about 37 lakhs of rupees. That means that in the Madras Presidency we will be spending twelve pies per head."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—" Fifty lakhs."

Rao Sahib U. RAMA RAO :—" Including public health which I have not included."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—" Fifty lakhs for medical including both medical and sanitation."

Rao Sahib U. RAMA RAO :— "At page 141 it is stated thus : '27 lakhs for hospitals and dispensaries, 10 lakhs for medical establishment, 7 lakhs for medical college and schools and the balance for expenses'. These amount to 48 lakhs. If you take into consideration the amount actually spent on public health, medical expenditure in hospitals and dispensaries they work up to the rate of 12 pies per head and for medical establishment it works up to the rate of 3 pies per head, that means to say 33⅓ per cent of the expenses goes to the medical establishment.

"The expenditure on public health comes to 20 lakhs which gives us 10 pies per head. The average expenditure per head per annum in the Madras Presidency comes up to roughly Rs. 3–1–8. That means to say out of an expenditure of Rs. 3 and odd we spend on hospitals and dispensaries 12 pies and 10 pies on public health, whereas we spend for justice about three times and for police four times and for civil works three times as much. That means the people and the Government both are anxious to safeguard their property and person more than their health. That is exactly what it comes to. I was all the while under the impression that it is only the people that are anxious to safeguard their property more than their health. But now it is conclusively proved by the budget that the State is more anxious to take care of its property than the health of the individuals.

"Then, Sir, as the Hon'ble the Finance Member stated we have one qualified medical practitioner for every 22,000 of the population in India whereas in the United States we have one for every 2,000. That means to say we want more medical men for which we must have more medical schools and colleges. All that means extra expenditure. We want one college at Vizagapatam, another

at Calicut; we want more medical schools established all over the country and the teaching must be improved. The L.M.P. course should be raised to five years and we must extend our medical relief. Students coming in large numbers are refused admission in several schools and colleges for want of accommodation. Unless and until we have several schools and colleges we cannot supply medical men to carry on the work of the medical relief. In fact we must duplicate the number of medical subordinates, because I know that, during the time of epidemics like cholera, plague and influenza, the men who are in permanent appointments in dispensaries had to close their dispensaries for a number of days and to go to look after those epidemics. So we want more dispensaries and doctors. When that is so we do require more schools and colleges and for all these things we want extra money. Further, for the last three years we have been spending at the rate of 27, 29 or 30 lakhs of rupees every year to supply medicines and drugs, whereas we know by experience that the cost of drugs and dressings and medicines has gone up a hundred times and more. That means to say in the dispensaries and hospitals people were able to manage for only six months and for the rest of the year they had to manage without sufficient medicine. I have got complaints from different parts of the Presidency to the effect that the stock of medicines supplied to them will not last for more than six months. From the beginning of the war the people in Madras and in the mufassal had not enough of drugs for treatment.

"Apart from these we want special hospitals in different parts of the Presidency. For instance, we have got only one eye hospital in the city of Madras. People who have eye diseases have to travel all the way to Madras. Hence it is necessary that we must open two, three or more eye hospitals in different parts of the Presidency.

"Again we have only one tuberculosis hospital in the city of Madras. According to the statistics given by the Health Officer every year 1,200 people die of consumption. For every tuberculosis patient that dies there will be not less than 40 patients who will have caught the contagion. That means to say in the city of Madras we have got no less than 48,000 people who have caught the contagion. All these people must be saved from developing consumption and should also be prevented from affecting others. It is therefore necessary that we must have some places for providing accommodation for these advanced cases of tuberculosis patients, so that the contagion may not spread. For all these things we require money. Only Rs. 20,000 is provided in the budget but another one lakh must be provided for.

"Then again we have the children's hospital in the city of Madras and to provide for enough of funds and accommodation nothing has been allotted in this budget. No doubt private enterprise and private contributions have gone a certain way in helping them, but that amount is not at all enough to maintain the hospital for two or three months. Consequently some amount must be provided in this budget.

"Then, Sir, we are in need of lady doctors in large numbers. The trained lady doctors are in urgent need not only in the city of Madras but also in the mufassal.

"Not only that, we want more sanitary inspectors. Of all the municipalities in the Presidency only three of them can boast of having a health officer, and when I questioned some of the chairmen of these municipalities they said they are not able to get health officers. That is because the payment that we offer them is very

small and this is the reason why the appointment does not attract trained health officers. In order to make it attractive they must be paid more, so that men with special qualifications might take up the work.

"Another thing is we want a large number of doctors to take up the medical inspection of schools. Apart from the dispensaries we want a set of men to go about to different schools and institutions to examine pupils medically. For that we have not got sufficient number of trained men.

"Venereal diseases and epidemic diseases are growing very much and infantile mortality is also causing great havoc in the Presidency. For the matter of that in the city itself every year not less than 6,000 children die before they reach the age of one year in spite of the protection taken in the city by the Corporation and other public agencies. That is to say, out of 20,000 chidren that are born every year in Madras, six thousand die before they reach the age of one year. That goes to show in what condition the infant's life is in the city of Madras. That is also another proof to show that the city is in a most insanitary condition. We are very badly in need of housing accommodation, and arrangements must be made for housing the poor. A large number of midwives and nurses ought to be trained and they must be sent to different parts of the Presidency, because in rural areas midwives are not available and owing to that, a number of children die.

"Another thing we want is more qualified compounders. The compounders that we have at present have no qualifications of any kind. They do not undergo any systematic training except that they in the hospital do some compounding work and at the end of that they are examined and given a diploma. In fact I can testify that these compounders are no good whatever. So classes must be opened for compounders in the different medical schools in the Presidency. These are the various items of expenditure, and I shall afterwards suggest some means as to how to get over the difficulty of finance. We are spending over a lakh of rupees for vaccination. With all that people die of smallpox and their number is very large. That is because every child by law must be vaccinated before it reaches the age of six months. After that there is no provision compelling a man or a boy to undergo revaccination. So we must have some means of revaccinating every person once in every six years, because the effect of vaccination passes away after six years. I think the educational authorities must realize this and when boys appear for the School Final examination they must insist on their getting revaccination certificates. If that is done, a good deal of havoc caused by smallpox will be minimized.

"Then again we Indians must do health propaganda work. We Indians are known for our *acharams* and for our orthodox ways. A Hindu or a Muhammadan, whether high class or low class, would not take his food without cleaning his mouth and teeth; that is part and parcel of his religious duty. Though it is not observed as a part of religious duty, still it is a scientific principle. So, such health ideas are already in us. But owing to varying conditions and circumstances, our conscience has become blunted. If propaganda work is carried on in the country by trained men, a good deal of sanitary work could be achieved. For this purpose I see that in the budget Rs. 18,800 is provided. How they are going to spend it I don't know. The details are not given.

"There is a great cry for ayurvedic and unani systems of treatment, and nothing has been provided in the budget for investigating these things. I have already sent notice of a resolution that an expert Indian Pharmocologist may be appointed at an early date to investigate and also report on the various drugs that are used in the ayurvedic and unani treatment, and for that purpose also we want

a large amount of money. To sum up, the expenditure on medicine is more than eaten up by the establishment. We have to pay about 3 lakhs of rupees to maintain the top—heavy service—the service of the Indian Medical Service men. Sir, we will be able to manage our medical and sanitary work with half that cost. Especially the recent war has conclusively proved that Indians who are qualified in our Indian Universities are able to carry on the work to the entire satisfaction of the people themselves and of the authorities concerned. But unfortunately according to some Government orders or enactments a certain number of Indian Medical Service men is bound to be provided for in this Presidency. That should be removed at an early date, which means it will give us 5 lakhs of rupees to be utilized for all these purposes. Another thing is in other parts of the world, for the matter of that in England, most of the appointments in the hospitals are managed by honorary men, whereas in India every service is paid for, including medical service. So that the system of honorary surgeons and physicians attached to big hospitals will save us a good deal of expenditure. When that is done in civilized countries, I do not see why we should not do it here. Somehow or other that idea which was started some years ago was given up.

"Sir, the principle of providing palatial buildings, what are called residential quarters for highly-paid officials of the Government, is bad, as emphasised also by the Honourable Member for Malabar. I have got a list of a number of such buildings in the different parts of the Presidency. For the matter of that in Tinnevelly there is a huge building built at a cost of Rs. 60,000 and used as the residence of the Executive Engineer who pays a rent of Rs. 50 a month. Look at the enormous amount of money that we lose by providing accommodation for such highly-paid men. Here I have got a list of civil works provided in the budget for 1921-22. A sum of Rs. 1,25,000 is provided for additions and improvements to three Government Houses; then again for repairs a lakh and odd. I have no objection to that. But at this crisis, at this juncture, when we are starving for money, what is the good of wasting—I do not call it 'wasting'—of spending a lot of money for the quarters of the District Forest Officer at Cuddapah(Rs. 10,000), for the quarters of the Conservator at Salem (Rs. 10,000). These are not urgent works at all and can be taken up for execution next year or whenever we are able to do so. I will just show how to cut off expenditure. Of course my honourable colleagues have enumerated various ways and I do not want to waste the time of the Council by going through them. In one department itself (the Public Works Department) we can save about 8 lakhs of rupees by cutting off expenditure.

"Then again, Sir, there is an association called 'Health and Welfare Association' whose secretaries are Indian Civil Service gentlemen. I do not know why Indian Civil Service men should be secretaries of such an association."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER (*interrupting*) :—"May I point out that he is not a paid secretary?"

Rao Sahib U. RAMA RAO (*continuing*) :—"I am very thankful to the honourable member for giving that information."

"Then again there is an appointment of Personal Assistant to the Surgeon-General at a cost of Rs. 1,100 a month. He has no professional work to do. Personal Assistant's work could be managed by a civil surgeon very easily and efficiently."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER (*interrupting*) :—"May I rise to a point of order? The post is held by an officer of the Indian Medical Service."

Rao Sahib U. RAMA RAO :—"That is why I say that it is unnecessary."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—"He is doing additional work."

Rao Sahib U. RAMA RAO :—"For the additional work he does he is paid extra.

"There is another officer in charge of the Publicity Board for which Rs. 1,21,000 is included in the budget for the next year. I am asking this House whether there is any justification for continuing this office at a heavy expenditure without some return. So that that item can be saved and given for the Medical Department.

"As for the non-gazetted officers and village officers my honourable friend from Rajahmundry has already dealt with them and I don't want to go over them again. With these few words I close."

Mr. S. ARPUDASWAMI UDAYAR :—"I beg to submit, Sir, that the provision made in the budget for certain items is most inadequate and that the provision made for other items is not the only kind of provision that can be made. I take, for instance, Education. I think the provision made for university education is not quite adequate. Objection was taken by one of the members to the acquisition of the site for the Queen Mary's College. But with the overcrowding of the city and with infectious diseases in the city, it will be necessary for the authorities of the institution to acquire the site."

Mr. T. A. RAMALINGAM CHETTIYAR (*interrupting*) :—"I didn't take objection to the acquisition of the site for the Queen Mary's College, but I said that the 3 lakhs provided for it should be expended in the Revenue Department and not in the Public Works Department."

Mr. S. ARPUDASWAMI UDAIYAR (*continuing*) :—"I am glad to be told that my friend has not taken objection to the acquisition of the site. But I would only submit that additional expenditure would be called for in order to have commodious buildings, more hostels and other things that will be necessary to improve the health of the student-population. I know we cannot look to the Sircar for everything. Private effort will be required to do a great deal. But still we must find a more liberal spirit than that displayed by Government in making grants to encourage university education, especially now when in the light of the report of the Calcutta University Commission, we shall have to spend more on laboratories and more on libraries. Therefore, if funds for other purposes could be cut short and more money made available for educational purposes, such a policy would, I think, bring about a state of things very much to be desired.

"As for secondary education, I think that even there the provision that is made is not quite adequate. If secondary education is to be placed on a satisfactory basis and if it is to fulfil the purpose for which it is intended, it should provide our students not only with the kind of equipment which they now possess when they look forward to Government employment as the goal of their aspirations, but also it ought to make our secondary school-leaving certificate men capable of taking to and developing industry, commerce, or for going to Japan, United States, England and other countries for learning the processes of manufacture there and after returning to this country, of doing their very best with this added knowledge to improve and enhance the material resources of this land. There is a growing tendency to make our secondary schools as much as possible small universities, affording a complete and most satisfactory kind of education —an education which would satisfy the needs and aspirations of the large bulk of the student-population and turn only a smaller number to the channels of univer-

sity education. So then, I believe the cost of secondary education will become greater and greater and the provision made for it I hope will be rendered more liberal by curtailments here and there.

" As regards the other items for which the kind of provision made is not the only kind of provision that ought to be made—I refer to Agriculture and Industries—I find that there are items like constructing additional quarters at the Agricultural College, construction of offices and workshops, and quarters for the agricultural demonstrators. I do admit that a great deal of good has been done by these institutions and by the agricultural experts employed at these institutions, but, Sir, I beg to submit that what the ryots want is not so much scientific information and scientific knowledge, but rather some kind of ocular demonstration, some sort of concrete representation of the benefits that will accrue to the people of this country by successful experiments carried on in these colleges. We read certain agricultural magazines and we read about the researches made by experts in all these institutions. I think more money ought to be spent on the employment of some men of subordinate services who would make it a point to tour through villages, distribute pamphlets, deliver lectures, tell the villagers, tell the ryots, that by the employment of the improved plough, or improved methods of cultivation or a better kind of manures than are locally available, they could derive much greater benefit than by following their old, old system of agriculture. Ryots, I know, fight shy of these new methods. So, unless we go to them and tell them that they must in their own interests adopt better methods of cultivation and unless they see clearly before their eyes the results of all experiments hitherto made with success, I doubt whether much good will result from the multiplication of institutions and by the multiplication of specialists. Again, Sir, as regards irrigation, as regards industries, I think greater good will result from the starting of certain practical methods of spreading certain industries which are fast dying out in villages. I find there are certain works which are pointed out at page 20 of the Public Works Department Budget Estimate, such as the proposed diversion of Kunnavaram-Parnesala cart-track; strengthening the Iritty bridge and road dam across the Upputeru river near the second mile. Now, these are the kinds of work that are wanted. I know of very many villages where we have hardly decent cart-tracks and, especially, at about this time, ryots find it extremely difficult to carry their produce to the market. Then again, here and there, we have certain small works to be done which will contribute very much to the prosperity of the ryots. So if little more money is found for all these works and if works costing very much could be for the present given up, I believe the right kind of provision will be made for these items in the Budget. Also, Sir, I beg to submit that some money ought to be found for increasing, to a slight extent, the starting salary of the non-gazetted officers and also for increasing by a trifle the starting pay of our copyists and village officers. The Government in their report, and the Committee appointed, have fixed the minimum starting salary at Rs. 40 and Rs. 35 and they say that in the case of graduates they might be started on Rs. 40 in the mufassal and Rs. 45 in the city. Therefore if, as is very likely, almost all the applicants are graduates, certainly provision will be found for fixing their pay at Rs. 40 and Rs. 45. So then, I find that by stretching our liberality a little more we can fix Rs. 40 and Rs. 45 as the starting salary of clerks. Again, Sir, I beg to remark that living in mufassal stations is not after all so very cheap as very many seem to think. I find mention made of Madura. I believe many would agree with me in saying that living at Trichinopoly is as costly as living at Madura. So then if Trichinopoly and Madura were also brought into the category of places

where living is very dear, such as the city of Madras, and if the low-paid clerks could be started also on the same salary that is fixed for the city, I think a great deal of good would result from such an arrangement. A great step will have been taken to conciliate these men and they will be contented. Well, as regards copyists, I don't like to say much. If the present arrangement of remunerating them at so many words per one anna will do them much greater good than by applying to them the scale laid down, I think it would be good to allow them to have the same privileges to which the other clerks are entitled, namely, of having their pay during the midsummer recess or of taking sick leave or of privilege leave on half pay—that would satisfy them. With regard to village officers, Sir, I believe the old glamour about their posts is fast disappearing, and with the institution of the village panchayat courts, I believe the village munsif even in cases where the office is hereditary will not command so much influence and so much respect as he has been doing till now. Again, I know that very many mirasidars, in whose families this office has been hereditary, do not like to take up that office when it is offered to them. For they think that it is beneath their dignity to dance attendance on, and to satisfy questions put to them by certain officers who go to them—not officers of the highest ranks of the service—and to get rid of the bother very many of them ask their subordinates or people under them to take up that office. So that, under the present circumstances, I think, Sir, that the fixing of a scale of something like Rs. 20 or so would satisfy those village officers and I believe the additional fund might be easily got by adopting this general principle, first of all of showing a greater disposition to conciliate all these men who form the very foundation upon which this grand superstructure of British administration has been raised, and secondly also of spending more on flesh and blood than on mere brick and mortar."

Rao Bahadur A. P. PATRO:—"It is said that there will be feast of sweet tongues and slashing of the civil budget estimates and I hope people outside this Council are satisfied that it is a feast of sweet reasoning and manifestation of strong civic right in the discussion of the Budget. I will add a little so that it may not go to surfeit. Sir, slashing up of the civil budget is rather very hard. The Public Works Department is very impervious. But I do not know if I shall be successful in attacking the stronghold. The Budget, as it is, I am constrained to say, is disappointing.

"The new constitution we have begun under very stringent circumstances. We have started with stinted means and insufficient resources, and no definite hopes are held out for the present moment that the position will be improved in the near future. No definite plans for the future advancement are indicated to make the reforms either successful or more popular. I do not ask for large surpluses, but I ask for bare financial justice in view of the large increase of revenue not only under Land Revenue, Excise and Stamps, but also under the reallotments of revenues under the new Act. The present position is largely due to the miscalculation that the imperial share of the burden will be much less than 384 lakhs. The balance at the credit of Government, namely, 206 lakhs, is most injudiciously spirited away. It is unfair to the tax-payer. The extravagant policy adopted last year showed itself in great deficit and it has raised hopes in all other services for demand of increased salaries. As has been observed by the Hon'ble the Finance Member and by the Salaries Committee, if both the superior and the subordinate services were examined together, the financial matters would have been in a different position. Whether or not it would have been possible to meet the increments demanded on all sides, whether or not the provincial resources would

have been able to meet the demand, to a certain extent, the demand would have been solved in a different manner. But as it is, a wrong step was taken in beginning with the highest officials in granting them increments and time scale, and as I would show later on, there are persons who began with Rs. 200 and in the second or third year got Rs. 400 or Rs. 500, or double the pay. When such acts are resulted by the method adopted by the Provincial Government it is bare justice perhaps for the other low-paid clerks to demand their right for increment in the salaries. I am not one of those who believe that the prices have gone up so high that they have come to stay, and therefore a permanent increment is unnecessary all round. The distinction that is made with regard to superior service and the subordinate service is this. With regard to superior service the increment is sanctioned under the principle that more efficiency is required and that the emoluments should be such that they will not be tempted to do less work or to have recourse to illegal means. That is the principle on which the superior services have been given increments. No doubt the increments were recommended by the Secretary of State and that the Provincial Government had to carry out the mandate of the Secretary of State. But the question raised is whether the Provincial Government was justified in taking up the question last year and granting these increments or not."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. Todhunter :—"I rise to a point of order. May I again point out that the Provincial Government did not take up the matter last year? The Public Services Commission was appointed in 1912 and the correspondence on it began in January 1917."

Rao Bahadur A. P. Patro :—"I thank the honourable member for the information. I know that it began in 1917. But why of all these years last year has been chosen to give effect to the recommendations, I am not able to see."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. Todhunter :—"I have already said that sanction was received the year before last and that we embodied proposals in last year's budget."

Rao Bahadur A. P. Patro :—"The amount that has been given to higher, superior services naturally raised hopes in the minds of the subordinate officers and they demanded the increase not on the ground of efficiency but on the ground of fall in the purchasing power of the rupee and on the ground of high prices. As the Hon'ble the Finance Member has said, prices have shown a bright outlook and this is indicated in the fall of prices by 25 per cent. High prices have not come to stay. If we examine the prices of food-stuffs and cereals, we find that nearly 33 per cent has already gone down. Under these circumstances, is it not unjustifiable that we should have a permanent addition to the burden and the liability of the Provincial Government? I would argue that while it is necessary that temporary relief should be given to the subordinate services, it is absolutely unnecessary from the tax-payer's point of view that we should add permanent burden to the provincial finance. Take the condition of the poor ryot in the Government area, who pays a kist of Rs. 30, Rs. 50 or Rs. 60 a year, or take the case of a ryot in zamindari area in a similar position. What is his condition after defraying all the expenses that he has to incur on the land? He has to maintain himself, his wife and children and also pay his farm servants and labour in the field day and night. Is he living in affluent circumstances? What is the kind of house that he lives in? What is the condition of the village and its sanitation? What is the kind of medical or sanitary help that he receives from the local or provincial authorities? You do not consider all these difficulties which the man who pays the tax undergoes or the circumstances surrounding him. It is his money that is now distributed

freely among these subordinate services and the non-gazetted officers. Therefore you have to consider from the tax-payer's point of view how far he is affected by the increase in the salaries. If you look at it from a tax-payer's point of view, I cannot sympathize with the large increments recommended and mostly permanent increments added to the superior services and in the subordinate services. I uphold that there should be a wholesale reduction of the salaries not only in the subordinate services, but also in the superior services. If you are for even a temporary raising of the salaries, what you should require is that this temporary raising of salaries should also help you in reducing the strength that is in existence either in the district administration or in the central administration. If you go through the budget statement, you will find—I will presently show—how many new offices have been created. Take for instance the Revenue Department. How many offices have been created newly over and above those that existed in 1920–21? In the statement that is given in the budget by the Hon'ble the Finance Member, as my friend from Malabar has said, a comparison of the number of appointments respectively in the years 1920–21 and 1921–22 under the head of numbers will show that in the year 1921–22 a number of new appointments are created for the first time, because under column 1921–22 we find certain numbers which are not to be found under 1920–21. Thus under the heads in 5 (*a*), 5 (*b*) and 5 (*c*) we find a large increase of new officers—increase of Deputy Collectors, Tahsildars, Deputy Tahsildars and Revenue Inspectors. This seems to me to be a quite unnecessary burden on the tax-payer. Therefore it is absolutely necessary that the budget should be carefully scrutinized.

"I must now take this opportunity to suggest that the form of the budget as it is prepared is not at all satisfactory. We have to look through five or six heads in order to find the actual expenditure on a principal head. If a sort of casting system of accounts as was proposed in connexion with municipal accounts in the Local Self-Government Conference is adopted in the budget, it will be very convenient. As president of the committee at the conference I realize the importance of this system. A clear analysis would save us so much time and energy and it will not give also much trouble to the Hon'ble the Finance Member in answering every question that is now raised. Take for instance the Land Revenue. Seventy per cent of expenditure is allotted to the Revenue head and 30 per cent to the Administration of Justice. No explanation is given why 70 per cent is given for revenue administration and 30 per cent for Administration of Justice. But the cost of the Commissioners of Land Revenue is included under the General Administration, and the cost of agency administration is included under the head of Administration of Justice. Therefore we find that the system that is now adopted is very confusing. It is difficult for any one to understand the budget in the form in which it is prepared. I come to the Council for the first time and I find it very difficult to go through the figures without necessary explanation appended."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. Todhunter :—"I may perhaps say to the honourable member that it is not within the power of this House or the Government of India but the Secretary of State to alter the budget heads."

Rao Bahadur A. P. Patro :—"It is not the question of budget head that I refer to. But it is the form of accounts. If the form of accounts is just arranged in a systematic form and an analysis is prepared with an explanation as to the various items, the budget will be clear and easily understandable not only by the House but also by the Finance Department. As it is, the Finance Department seems to have taken immense trouble for preparing the accounts. For instance, under the Land Revenue head it is stated what is to be voted for and what is not

to be voted for. What I say is that if the form of the accounts is to be carefully analysed, then it would give us a clear idea and the various heads analysed would give at the first glance the revenue and expenditure under each principal head.

"To go back to my review, I was pointing out to the House that in the case of the revenue administration there is such a large increase of officers. I will illustrate my point by reading to you certain portions of the budget. In the detailed account under 5 (*a*), page 29, under Charges on District Administration you find four additional Deputy Collectors on a pay of Rs. 1,000—1,200 in 1921–22, 25 Additional and Temporary Deputy Collectors at a cost of Rs. 90,000, while there were none in 1920–21. Again there are in 1921–22, 143 Deputy Collectors at a total cost of Rs. 9,07,560. In the overhauling of this department I find a reduction in peons from 434 to 289 and these peons carry a salary of Rs. 15 and below. This is all the reduction we find. On the other hand there is the addition of temporary Deputy Collectors and Revenue Inspectors. At page 30 under Divisional Office establishments the clerks are increased from 212 to 522. We are not only paying increased salary to the clerks but also are increasing their number. Again there is an increase of attenders from 34 to 98 and muchis from 36 to 100. Travelling allowance of Collectors and Sub-Collectors was Rs. 3,28,000 and it has now come to Rs. 5,36,000. Under Taluk establishments we find 137 Deputy Tahsildars and 33 Probationary Deputy Tahsildars. The travelling allowance which was Rs. 4,70,000 for Tahsildars and Deputy Tahsildars has gone up to Rs. 5,79,000. Under 5-B. Survey and Settlement we find that there are three Assistant Directors drawing more amount than what they drew last year. For temporary establishment Rs. 5,88,608 is provided. The travelling allowance is rupees one lakh. Similarly, with regard to the establishment under Maintenance of Land Records at page 40, we find 187 Revenue Inspectors are appointed. Temporary addition to pay has come to Rs. 1,16,000, i.e., while the revised estimate in 1920–21 was Rs. 3,37,500, it has now come to Rs. 5,76,204. The travelling allowance has gone up. Three Tahsildars are newly appointed and local allowance for high prices is also given. Four Tahsildars are under training.

"Taking the case of Excise—6-A—under Salaries, Establishments and Contingencies, page 45, under existing arrangements, you will find that two-thirds is debited to Excise and one-third to Salt. Excise has become a transferred subject. The abkāri officer does both the Excise and Salt works. Expenditure under Salt should now be separated from Excise. The two-thirds fixed by the Excise Committee in 1905–06 now requires revision. The question must be settled in consultation with the Imperial Government. How this two-thirds was fixed is a matter for which no explanation is given in the budget."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. Todhunter:—"It is a very long-standing arrangement."

Rao Bahadur A. P. Patro:—"That is the very reason why we should examine it. We are now in a new condition of things, a new constitution and a new administration with more freedom than before. We are entitled to examine the time-honoured customs and the traditional way of budgeting. Therefore, Sir, we have a right to know how this two-thirds and one-third have been fixed. Thus in every department new offices have been created and new salaries have been attached. The Honourable Member for Coimbatore has effectively pointed out how under 8-B, page 52, in the case of Forests, the income is 58·62 lakhs and the charges are Rs. 30,66,000. In 1920–21 the expenditure was Rs. 27,37,000. The creation of new appointments is a burden on the tax-payer, as I have already pointed out, and I shall abstain from referring to details.

"Similarly, with regard to education, additional burden is imposed. The question of the Commissioner of Labour has also been dealt with. Therefore I will not take up more time by referring to the various departments and to the new offices that are created. Whether there is work for them or not it is only in the result we see that. The principal question that the House will put to the Government is—what is the necessity for the creation of the various new offices? In reply to the interpellation by the representative of the landholders of the northern group, the Government were pleased to answer that the efficiency was not at all affected in the matter of the Agency administration when it was under the District Collector. But when the financial statistics were required they were not furnished. Nevertheless the House will see that the administration of the Agency was very well conducted. For the new change sufficient reasons are not given. And yet you see from the head of Administration of Justice that various works are to be constructed in the Agency tracts. This shows that a large amount of money is required from the provincial finance in order to keep up the Agency districts. The explanation of the Finance Member in his memorandum is that the Divisional officers were not in touch with the Agency people under existing conditions. Was there inefficiency? Was there extravagance in the old system of administration of the Agency tracts by the Collectors? When the reply is that it was satisfactory, what necessity is there for the creation of a new department? We miscalculated that our Imperial contribution would be very much lessened. We had wiped out last year's balances and we have gone for loans. Nine and odd lakhs are to go to the Imperial Government by way of interest."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER:—"May I point out that the sum of nine and odd lakhs is not the interest, but the repayment of the outstanding balance of the Provincial loan account?"

Rao Bahadur A. P. PATRO:—"All the more the matter is serious. This is not merely for the payment of interest but for the payment of principal. We are in the position of debtor who borrows money from one sowcar and pays over to the same sowcar with the addition of more interest burdened on it. We have to consider where to find the money for developments. The inauguration of the new Reforms has created hopes in the country that some development is going to be made. What is the development that we are able to show out of this budget? Now the Hon'ble the Finance Member has rightly stated that there was a warning when the Reforms began that we ought to be prepared for fresh taxation and to raise funds. Improving the finance is possible only in three ways—(1) taxation, (2) drawing upon our balances and (3) retrenchment. As far as taxation is concerned, it is impossible at this stage that we can go to the country to impose additional taxation. That is out of question. Two sources have been referred to, viz., the land revenue and the excise revenue. To the land revenue, it is impossible to add a pie. The Hon'ble the Finance Member has referred to the prosperity of the ryot during the war. It is said that the ryot is prosperous owing to the high prices of paddy, whereas the professional people had to pay very high income-tax and the ryot had nothing of that kind. Therefore, the Finance Member thinks that the land can further be taxed. I would submit in reply that this is really missing the point. While the price of paddy has gone up in price, all other necessaries also have gone up in price. If the price of paddy has gone up by three or four times, the prices of other necessaries too have gone up four or five times. Therefore whatever high prices there may be, they do not benefit the ryot economically. Because if he sells his paddy for high prices he has to pay high prices for his other necessaries. Taxation also has already gone so high that the ryot cannot bear any

further burden. Then with regard to the excise revenue, I am one of those who think that we should put down the rise in the excise revenue. I believe that the country is already awakening and that the question of intemperance will be tackled seriously. It is not therefore a hopeful sign to think that the excise revenue can be increased any further. The only two sources from which we can have an expansion of revenue are proved to be incapable of development.

"Then the other alternative opened is raising a loan. Can we raise a loan unless we have got a sinking fund? Our balances show that we are not able to pay for a sinking fund. Neither with the sinking fund nor with balances, how can we go to the country and ask for loans? The Hon'ble the Finance Member has given indication showing how difficult it was for the Government to raise a loan. Therefore the question of raising a loan in order to supplement provincial finances and to carry on developments in various directions becomes impossible.

"Then the other alternative left to us is retrenchment. This retrenchment cannot be very violent. It must be a reasonable one. It must be such as not to affect efficiency. At the same time it should be made from top to bottom. Not only the additional hands that have been put in in the budget for 1921–22 should be eliminated, but also we must impress upon the Government and the Secretary of State that the additional offices that have been created should be eliminated and the emoluments paid to the officers also should be limited. While I realize that there is difficulty and that it will take much time in obtaining the permission from proper authority and it would require a thorough revision of the Government of India Act, I must say that we cannot keep quiet without raising our voice and submitting to Government and the Secretary of State that this is the only way left open to the country to effect economy in the matter of administration. The cost of administration has become very heavy. The whole thing has been put in in a nut-shell in pages 2 and 3 of the budget. There we find against disbursements charged to revenue Rs. 1,702·03 lakhs. The contribution to Central Government is 324 and odd lakhs. There remain Rs. 321·07 lakhs against direct demands on revenue. Then for civil administration it is Rs. 678·09 less. Provision for exchange is Rs. 152·93 lakhs. The total comes to Rs. 1,152·19 lakhs. Therefore what remains goes only to the development of the various departments."

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT:—"The Honourable Member has exceeded his time-limit by ten minutes. But I do not want to interrupt him and I only want to give him a friendly note of warning, so that he may wind up."

Rao Bahadur A. P. PATRO:—"It will therefore be seen that when we got 228 lakhs by adjustment, we have got 228 lakhs increase over our ordinary revenue. The provincial revenues were augmented by about 228 lakhs by the Imperial adjustment. In addition to these 228 lakhs we have got also a large increase in land revenue and excise. All this increase is wiped out by an increase in the salaries as stated in the reply to question No. 398. In this state of things, it is impossible to run the administration on any lines of improvement, development and efficiency. The sources from which we can draw revenue are very limited. When the sources are limited, and when we have sapped all the funds, we are left in the position in which we are, what is the answer to the country, to the electorate and to yourselves? How can we improve the finance unless we apply the pruning process very cautiously, carefully and effectively? It has been pointed out—as was also referred to by the other members who spoke before me—that the matter is under consideration and that great retrenchment is going to be done. The present outlook however is very deplorable. Unless we take steps to see that expenditure is reduced in the next sitting of the Council when we discuss the various

items in detail, unless we apply the pruning process very carefully and effectively, we will be left without any funds for development. We draw all our resources from agriculture and what have we done in order to improve the condition of the agriculturists? What have the Government done? The Government no doubt created the Agricultural department ten years back. The Government have been recruiting very able and scientific officers; but I have got my own misgivings—."

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT:—" The Honourable Member has got two minutes more. He must wind up."

Rao Bahadur A. P. PATRO:—" Yes, thanks, Sir, I will wind up. There was recruitment of scientific men in 1920–21 and every year there is recruitment. But what is the kind of propagandist work that is being done in the country and in the districts? What is the kind of work that these scientific men are doing in the district, taluk and the village? From my own personal experience I can give you any number of instances. But suffice it for the present to say that I am not at all satisfied with the Agricultural department which has not been able to do any good to the ryot population either in the way of improving the manure or raising new crops or in the matter of economic growth of crops, which are absolutely necessary in the interests of the cultivator.

" Again with regard to Industries, I am sorry that the subject has not been properly dealt with by the Honourable Members. The only things that we find in the budget are the Fisheries Bureau, Oil and Soap Industry, an Institute at Madura and another at Madras. These are the things provided for in the budget. Sir, if this is to be the development of industrial resources of the country, if this is the material advancement of the people of this country, if there are to be such small industrial means as soap manufacture in the rural areas by which the industrial condition is to be developed, it is no credit to the country. The policy should be how far capital aid and scientific aid should be given to small industries and how far this kind of aid can be rendered. Unless we do this we will be nowhere. We will be groping in the dark. An industrial survey should be undertaken. Industrial survey should be prepared and we must develop small industries. To that end I am sure that the Hon'ble the Minister and the Hon'ble the Finance Member will be able to find sufficient means in order to develop the industries."

Rai Bahadur T. M. NARASIMHACHARLU:—" Sir, the budget that has been presented by the Hon'ble the Finance Member may be said in one respect to be a bumper one, in another respect a starving one. Though the closing balance is shown to be 35 lakhs, still it should be remembered that it was arrived at only after taking into credit the loan of 70 lakhs proposed to be borrowed from the Government of India at an advanced rate of half per cent. No doubt there is this consolation, and on this I wish to offer my congratulations to the Hon'ble the Finance Member. We have not got to go in for additional taxation like the Government of India nor do we budget for large deficits like some other sister provinces. But the fact remains that the budget is really a deficit one but for the loan referred to above. I have just now referred that the budget is a bumper one in one respect. It is bumper in this respect, viz., that the public servants have been very well looked after. I call it a starving one because the people from whom the bulk of the taxes is drawn have not been shown due consideration. I am afraid that the Government of this country is being carried on on wrong lines. I had hoped that the first budget would not be 'a carrying on' budget. But my hopes were dashed to the ground. No doubt it should not be the aim of any one, much less of the new Ministers, to make radical changes or to disturb the continuity of policy that is in vogue if really the existing system or policy is a

8th March 1921] [Mr. T. M. Narasimhacharlu]

sound one. The function of the Government should be to secure the greatest contentment and happiness of the greatest number of the people. In the newly formed Government this policy ought to have been evident to some extent at least, and not the continuity of the old policy of the late bureaucratic form of Government. Their policy seems to have been, perhaps unconsciously, to secure the greatest contentment and happiness of the smallest number, i.e., the public servants. Even among the servants those in the higher grades seem to have been more favoured than those in the lower grades. It seems that the revenues are gathered not for making a suitable and substantial return to the people but for securing the largest benefit to the public servants. For, witness the disproportionate manner in which revenue is allotted to the payment of salary, allowance and pension to the establishment and to the purpose directly beneficial to the people. Out of the seventeen crores and odd of revenue budgeted for, nearly three-fourths is proposed to be spent on the services. However, I share in the hope expressed by the Hon'ble the Finance Member that this state of affairs cannot continue and that the first task in the year 1921-22 will be a complete overhauling of the administrative machine with a view to effect economy, and I am fully confident that the overhauling will be as drastic as the curtailment of the programme of development for the budget year. The retrenchment should begin at the top in respect of both number and pay of the officers and should then go down to the bottom. In this country where the Government has long been settled, where it has been carried on in an orderly manner and where the people are docile and law-abiding it should be possible to re-arrange the districts, divisions and taluks into units of greater dimensions and thus reduce the establishments from top to bottom. No doubt the view that I advance may be a novel one; for the cry is to subdivide districts. On further consideration and on mature thought, what I submit will, I think, carry some weight with the authorities. In a comparatively cheap country like India it should be possible even for a European public servant of the status of the Collector and upwards to live decently and to maintain his status and dignity with between rupees twenty and twenty-five thousands a year. Larger incomes are more often inducements to go in for luxuries and to court unhealthy pleasures which, by habit, become necessaries. Among the lower grades of service, keep only such number as are absolutely necessary for the upkeep of efficiency, pay them decently, keep them contented and make them work whole-heartedly and well. There is no necessity for an army of low-paid, discontented and half-hearted public servants. These are the main principles which should, in my humble opinion, guide the Government in the direction of effecting retrenchment and economy.

"People are very little served in those directions which concern their welfare most. In irrigation, in works of popular utility, not merely of public utility as is put down in the budget, in education, in sanitation, in agriculture, in industry, in short, in all those forms of development whereby people can grow richer, healthier and wiser, Sir, we find that no adequate provision is made in the budget at all. Indeed it is admitted that in the matter of public health and civil works adequate provision could not be made in the budget and this is the starvation side of the budget.

"It seems to me that in the matter of co-operation, Sir,—I shall only limit my observations to a few cases—the department is made top-heavy. While the real workers, the inspectors, are little cared or provided for both as regards their pay and status which after all is only a temporary one, in this year the Government have proposed to increase the assistant registrars from 9 to 22 with a salary varying from Rs. 300—."

[Mr. T. M. Narasimhacharlu] [8th March 1921

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur K. VENKATA REDDI NAYUDU (*interrupting*) :—"There is some slight mistake in the figures. They ought to be 17 and 22. We have already 17."

Rai Bahadur T. M. NARASIMHACHARLU (*continuing*) :—"Even if it were 17, I find no justification for the increase. And I would go to the length of saying that even 17 is rather too many and look at the salary between Rs. 300—850. On the other hand, the number in the increase of inspectors is only from 116 to 367. These inspectors are the persons that go about to the villages, that induce the people to enter into co-operation and that make the position and status of the villagers more respectable and more happy and less amenable to the influences of the village money-lender. The relief which this department has been giving to the poor people from the clutches of the money-lender is immense ; and yet, this is the way in which they are treated.

"Nextly, Sir, with regard to education, I may state that the provision in regard to this also is most discouraging. Again even here the prevailing idea seems to be to increase the number of higher inspecting staff so that there will be one inspector for every district and one sub-assistant for every taluk. I think, Sir, this is radically wrong. In the secondary schools with which this inspecting staff is dealing, most of the teachers are generally well educated and trained teachers and can be trusted to do their duty without very much supervision. Why then should there be more inspecting staff? The too frequent visits of the inspector and his inspections are often embarrassing to the teachers and the pupils alike and the best policy is to give greater freedom to them than to be placed under constant discipline and endless instructions which vary with the moving inspectors who are more often transferred than kept at the same place for a definite amount of time. Instead, I would suggest, if any supervision or discipline is necessary, a local committee of visitors to whom the teachers will certainly pay due respect and it will act upon the teachers on account of the public opinion which will be created in the locality to do their duty satisfactorily. I think, Sir, that is the best way to conduct schools on proper basis and not by multiplying the number of the inspecting staff. In my opinion, five or six inspectors for the whole Presidency are quite enough.

"Nextly, Sir, I have to deal, though very shortly, with the way in which money is being spent on the buildings. In my opinion there is absolutely no use in spending money on costly and palatial buildings either for offices or for officers' quarters. Much of it can be spent on useful productive works and for the amelioration of the masses, and also the depressed classes. When the depressed classes have not even cottages, I fail to see what pressing need there is for palatial quarters for the officers and why the poor people from whom the bulk of the money is gathered should be neglected at all. Is it because they are voiceless? Well, Sir, we here represent them ; we have got our voice ; let us raise it and let us raise it effectively here.

"The Government have not acted fairly in respect of the elementary school teachers in omitting to provide for the extra grant of Rs. 4 to each of them. Then it was said by the Government, by the Hon'ble the Finance Member, that they have made the Acts ready for us, the Acts being the Municipalities Act, the Local Boards Act, the Village Panchayats Act and the Education Act. These Acts have been made ready for us and there is provision in them that we should get more money by taxation from the people and we should serve the cause of education to the people. Well, Sir even assuming that there is that provision, the Acts which give increased sources of revenue to the local bodies have scarcely yet

been brought into force and it is too early to expect the local bodies to be ready now to pay the extra allowance to the teachers. In fairness, the Government should have provided for the grant in the budget for this year at least. Nor is the order resuming the special grant balances justifiable at all seeing that the Government are not going to give anything in the future and seeing that the resources of the local bodies have always been meagre and slender. Again, Sir, the Government have discontinued the compassionate grant of 5 lakhs to the poor district boards like mine. The undertaking by the Government to defray the cost of maintaining trunk roads has not been equitable or fair to all the district boards for some have profited by it and some not. Nor is the diversion of 14 lakhs grants to the maintenance of second-class roads a blessing at all as it compels the district boards to find an equivalent amount from their own resources before they can claim any portion of the grant.

"It is my humble opinion that a good part of the police establishment may be dispensed with. No doubt, the Government have realized this and propose to a certain extent to abolish the vacancy reserve gradually. My proposal is that this department also may be curtailed along the lines proposed by me above in the case of the district administration. Above all, in the case of these police, there is one item about which there is absolutely very little need and that is the provision to maintain 35,550 talaiyaris. Some of them are called police talaiyaris, some of them ryotwari talaiyaris and some talaiyaris in proprietary estates. These serve no useful purpose; they are very often looking after the private work of the officers under whom they serve. Their actual work, so far as the ryotwari talaiyaris are concerned, is only in the collecting season. Very rarely offences take place. The rest of the year they spend away their time on their own business or on the business of those under whom they are employed. So also with regard to the police talaiyaris. They spend their time mostly in cutting grass and bringing fuel to the officers under whom they serve Sir, my humble submission is that this is a costly establishment and I pray that the sooner this establishment is reduced within reasonable limits, the better it will be.

"Next, Sir, my observation is with reference to the veterinary dispensaries. This is one of those items that come under the starved subjects. Now, Sir, we all know that the people are mostly agriculturists in this country. They have got cattle, and the cattle die in legions when any epidemic disease breaks out. The cattle are also subject to accidental wounds and injuries. The establishment at present of only a few hospitals and dispensaries in the Presidency is quite inadequate. And it is to be hoped and fervently hoped that at no distant date large numbers will be provided for the benefit of the agriculturists in this respect.

"It is also fervently hoped that with the advent of popular Government there will be expansion and improvement in the directions of agriculture, industry, labour and co-operation and greater happiness, less misery and less disease to the people will be the object aimed at both by the executive as well as the Ministers. And this can only be achieved by a rigid curtailment and retrenchment from top to bottom. I appeal to the Ministry, Sir, to begin this at once. They must put pressure upon the other part of the Government to begin the curtailment at once, and not to be led away by them for the continuity of their old policy. No doubt, His Excellency is going to come forward to our aid. Let the Ministers also lose no time in this affair and let them begin the task at once. Therein, Sir, lies the prosperity of our country, lies the happiness of our people who have sent us here not only to guard ourselves but to guard them as well. Sir, let it be remembered that we owe a greater duty to the people, who made it possible for some of us to

be appointed ministers. Let us not be swayed by any sentiments of false delicacies or gratitude, but let us prove true ministers to the people and not to the bureaucracy. No Government, much less a ministry, can long stand which is not 'broad based on the people's love' as the poet has said and if we do not do our duty now, I am sure the time is not far distant when we shall have to repent and say 'had we but served our country as faithfully as we served the democracy, the voters would not have forsaken us like this in this our next elections.'"

Rao Bahadur C. B. RAMA RAO:—"Mr. President, I have not been acquainted with other departments of administration than medicine and sanitation and I will confine my few brief remarks to these departments. The previous speakers have pointed out the necessity for retrenchment. No doubt, everybody says that it is necessary that funds should be made available for the most pressing needs of the country. How it is to be done is the problem that faces this House and each member of this House is expected to offer suggestions according to the light which his experience has given him. And I beg to say that, from my experience of medical administration, there are certain clear grounds which we can cover, certain ways in which we can contribute towards the betterment of the service.

"First of all, as to the establishment. It will not be possible to curtail the establishment but it will be easy to supplement the paid machinery by certain honorary workers. It is well known that in western countries the most advanced hospitals are run by private doctors. They give their time and energy and knowledge free to these charitable institutions in order that they may gain fame and experience in the profession. And what is possible in other countries is equally possible in this country. In fact, it will not be a new experiment at all. For, as long ago as 1907, during Lord Morley's regime, as Secretary of State for India, he sent out a despatch directing that the officers of the Government hospitals should be gradually replaced by honorary workers. And the experiment was given a brief trial and a few medical graduates, graduates of the local University, were admitted into these hospitals, and some of them have acquitted themselves so creditably that they became the envy of the paid officers. And why it was that the custom was dropped and why they were not continued I do not know. I am sure that this much can be said. The few instances that I have in mind—I need not quote names here—justify our repeating the custom not in small numbers or so cautiously as it was done years ago, but very largely. I am sure that if private medical practitioners offered their services during the war and acquitted themselves during those trying times creditably, it will be much more reasonable to expect that they will turn out much better work, give greater satisfaction and contribute towards the economy of the administration in a large way. I hope that our present Minister in whose hands the departments of Public Health and Medicine lie will take good care to economize his branch of administration by encouraging local talent, not to the disparagement of paid officers but to co-operate with them. And there are several who will be very glad to offer their services in this way.

"The second point is with regard to sanitation. It has been urged that sanitation is in a very backward way and as a remedy that popular health lectures should be instituted in various parts of the Presidency, and an amount of Rs. 18,800 has been allotted for this item. These popular lectures were delivered a few years ago and I have played some part in organizing them. Unless they are followed by immediate practical demonstration and unless they are continued so as to leave a lasting impression on the people, unless the lecturer and those lectured to are continually in contact with one another, I do not believe that they will serve any

useful and abiding purpose. It will be a *tamasha* of the day and all that is said will be forgotten. With the view of making the effects permanent and lasting, I propose that the Sanitary department of this Presidency should be reconstituted, I may also mention that the Sanitary Commissioner for Madras was practically absent throughout the last official year; and the Surgeon-General held both the offices of the Surgeon-General and Sanitary Commissioner. No loud cry was heard from any quarter in any way and things went on properly. So we can utilize that experience and have one head for both the departments and increase the number of actual workers lower down in the grades. To come to the point, what I propose is to increase the number of Deputy Sanitary Commissioners, to make them personally responsible for carrying out a detailed programme of work in sanitation and entrust to them two or three districts each, and not have one Sanitary Commissioner who will not be able to respond to calls from various parts of the Presidency. I know on one occasion when plague broke out in Negapatam the Sanitary Commissioner was wired for; he had other pressing demands to attend to and he could not come; things were delayed and with the result that instead of the epidemic being nipped in the bud it went on spreading because there was no responsible sanitary officer on the spot; whereas if a Deputy Sanitary Commissioner was within a hundred miles or so the District Surgeon or the local civil surgeon or the medical officer could easily summon him whenever there was any sanitary problem to be solved. He would then be available immediately. It will be impossible to expect one officer to be available in all the different parts of this vast Presidency.

"The third point that I would urge before this House is to cut down the expenditure under the heading of stipends, books and instruments given to medical students. I have been while in service, the superintendent of a medical school and I know what a large demand there is for medical education. If there are 20 vacancies in a school there are 200 applicants. It may be said that many of them are not competent. But there is no denying the fact that the taste has been kindled and the thirst for medical knowledge is very keenly felt in our young men. The solution will be to open more medical schools, not of the costly type we have at present, but to encourage local private practitioners to open medical schools and give them such grants as may be necessary to encourage them in their efforts. In fact, this is not my own idea; it is the idea coming down from the India Office. When the Medical Adviser to the Secretary of State, Sir Havelock Charles came here the other day, he came out to do something which we do not know; but I was told while in England that he was going out here to improve the medical services. Before he left southern India, I had returned, and I was surprised to learn that he did not confer even with a single private medical practitioner in southern India in regard to the object of his visit. I ran up to Calcutta and made it a point to pay him a visit and the Provincial Medical Association there arranged for a deputation—an informal deputation —at which we had a long discussion as to how to better the prospects of the Indian medical men. He said that there was a great demand for more medical men and that Government were not prepared to open more schools and colleges at once for various reasons, one of them being finance, and that the only solution would be for the private practitioners to open private medical schools and for the Government to recognize them. Well, I say on behalf of the medical practitioners of southern India that there are many here who are ready and willing to offer their services and to run a medical school provided the head of the medical department will encourage them and accord his support. The time has now come, I draw the particular attention of the House, to

drop the system of paying stipends and give books and instruments free to students. There are ever so many ready to join as private students paying their own fees and meeting their own expenses. I think it is not desirable that the Government should pay stipends to these medical students. It is true that the Government demands of them rather hard and unnecessary conditions If these conditions are relaxed I am sure the demands will be met very easily. What they are I shall state very briefly."

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT :—" I fear the honourable member is not talking about the budget. He is talking about the conditions of admission into medical schools. If there is anything about that in the budget he will be good enough to explain so that the other members may see."

Rao Bahadur C. B. RAMA RAO *(continuing)* :—" Mr. President, I beg to draw the attention of the House to page 152 of the budget where Rs. 90,000 have been provided for stipends and books of civil pupils and Rs. 42,500 for instruments and chemicals. I consider that expenditure unnecessary and extravagant and I think that that amount can be utilized for other purposes. I was going to explain why such inducements had been necessary in the past, and they had been necessary because a Sub-Assistant Surgeon from the southernmost district was expected to be ready to go to the northernmost district, from Tinnevelly to Ganjām. If the Presidency could only be divided into four parts as Telugu, Malayalam, Kanarese and Tamil, and the students could be taken from each group of districts separately and they be asked to execute an agreement to serve in those districts, I do not think they will expect any Government help, and the response to the Government notification will be very large. So this amount can be saved. And lastly I would draw the attention of the House to the large figures on page 157. Against the Bubonic plague Rs. 1,05,900, Malaria Rs. 1,65,700, cost of quinine packets supplied by the Jail Department Rs. 50,000. I do not know about the last. But about the first two, Mr. President, I think they are part and parcel duties of the Sanitary Department. If the Sanitary Department can be reorganized on the lines I have indicated, that is to have more Deputy Sanitary Commissioners—one for every two or three districts—they may be made to draw up a certain definite active programme of work, and keep to those programmes and if these are entrusted to them much of the amount that is now spasmodically spent in different parts whenever an epidemic frightens the local authorities can be saved. Money is lavishly spent. Instead of that, preventive measures could be taken well beforehand and the local Sanitary Officer being a man of high education and of the Deputy Sanitary Commissioner's grade will be able to nip many an epidemic in the bud. I know that this has been done whenever the local Medical Officer has been on the alert and very active, and things were going on very differently when conditions were otherwise. We want good subordinate staff. There is no use having high placed officers in the centre who cannot reach the remote corners of the district and watch the approaches of the epidemics, and I say if that can only be organized no less than three lakhs of rupees will be thus saved. I have not read this budget very carefully, but I daresay that a good deal of cutting down will be possible and money will be made available for purposes other than those indicated against the figures given in the budget."

Sriman BISWANATH DAS :—" Mr. President, Sir, this is the first budget of its kind in which the legislature is called upon to vote for the grants. The Indian people will be thankful to the British Government for having, though partially, conferred this right. The faith that Britain will keep up her pledges of August

20th, 1917, is restored by the ruling of the Speaker in the House of Commons regarding the right of Indian legislature and also the nomination of Lala Harkrishnan Lal to the Ministry in the Punjab, and the recent 11 per cent customs duty is but another test to the true intents of Britain as to the giving of fiscal autonomy to India. While thanking the Government, while thanking the British people for the privileges thus conferred, we cannot help pointing out the costly system of Government that has unnecessarily been evolved. The Provincial Executive, instead of three councillors, now multiplied itself into four executive councillors and three ministers. In paragraph 218, the Montagu-Chelmsford Report lays down that 'an Executive Council with two members . . . . One of the two executive councillors would in practice be an European and the other would be an Indian'. The Shelbourne committee is equally clear, very unfortunately though it left the option to the Indian Government. 'The committee are of opinion that the normal strength of the executive council specially in small provinces, need not exceed two members.' The Government have, however, had to justify their action in embarking on a very costly establishment of four members. The burden is made heavier by fixing the pay of these councillors at Rs. 64,000 per annum each, the maximum scale provided in the schedule of the Government of India Act, 1919. The question of the minister's salary is one, which, I believe, should draw the attention of this House. The recommendations of the Selbourne Committee are quite significant here. They advise that 'the status of the ministers should be similar to those of the members of the Executive Council but that the salaries should be fixed by the Legislative Council.' In the same report, the same committee have suggested—which has been accepted—that the Indian members of the Council of India, in London, should be paid a higher scale of remuneration than the British members. The same principle the Committee recommends to the Legislative Council. The Indian members now get £1,800 a year while the British members are paid only £1,200 each. No one would for a moment believe that a higher salary enhances the status of an officer. I would therefore ask the House to vote only a decent salary as is necessary, irrespective of the pay of the executive councillors, over whose pay we have no control. The members of this House may set an example of economy by accepting a single first-class ticket with a servant and the travelling allowance of all first-class officers must be similarly curtailed.

"The Director of Industries, in his evidence before the Industrial Commission said that 'Madras is and will remain an agricultural country'. Madras has been as a matter of fact mainly an agricultural country, having about 80 per cent of her population depending on agricultural industry which is always dependent on the seasonal monsoons. It is therefore necessary for the Government to be on its alert, providing enough of irrigation sources and an adequate famine fund to defy the havocs of stress and famines. The allotment of funds to these important items do not show that the Government are quite alive to the needs of the situation. The budget provides 11·28 lakhs of rupees for irrigation, and 6·61 lakhs for famine, while the agricultural department is provided with 31·13 lakhs, more than half of which is consumed by highly paid officers. The budget estimates for these three years show enormous rise in expenditure in agricultural department without any substantial result:—That is, in 1919–20, the allotment was 19·64 lakhs, in 1920–21, the allotment was 23·43 lakhs, in 1921–22, the allotment was 31·13 lakhs. 'Water and manure together,' says Dr. Voelker 'in brief, represent the ryot's main wants.' This year's budget shows an increase of 25 per cent in the expenditure, about 70 per cent of which is provided towards the

pay of twelve seats for the Indian Agricultural service without any provision being made for the real needs of the peasantry, very rightly pointed out by Dr. Voelker. Irrigation is stunted and starved and is provided with a pittance of 11·20 lakhs specially, when the improvements of the irrigation sources have been the cry everywhere. Irrigation, while preventing famines, brings with it a good income to the State; and it is most regrettable that this should have found no provision in the budget, except that of a loan of 11·28 lakhs from the Government of India.

"The Government of India had a Famine Insurance Fund of 1½ crores of rupees a year. The separation of the central and provincial finances removed the necessity of such a fund. Provision however is made in the Government of India Act, that each Local Government mentioned in the Schedule IV, shall establish and maintain, out of the provincial revenues, a famine insurance fund. Schedule IV makes it imperative on the Government of Madras to set apart a sum of Rs. 6·61 lakhs. We see however that the Revenue Department which feeds fat on the agricultural income contributes only 6·47 lakhs, thus neutralizing the very provisions of the Act itself. It is most unfortunate to have made a scanty provision for this year and that by way of a loan."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER (*interrupting*):—"May I point out, Sir, that the provision required by the schedule has been made?"

Sriman BISWANATH DAS (*continuing*):—"I submit, Sir, that the provision has not been made, if you take away the item that is included from the Loans Fund.

"Then comes the income under Forest Revenue which practically feeds the high officials and their heavy establishments. I give below the expenditure of the past three years:—

	Income.	Expenditure.
	LAKHS.	LAKHS.
	RS.	RS.
1919–20	36 93	...
1920–21	47·7	...
1921–22	58·86	55 58

out of the last year's income. We have not figures for these three years. Out of this year's estimation, 55·88 lakhs have been set apart for establishment and conservancy works. The Educational Department cannot be very much congratulated for the grant of 158 lakhs. It will only be able to meet the increased salary of the Inspectorate and the teaching staff. About 15·31 lakhs go towards the expenses of the inspectorate, i.e., 9½ per cent is consumed. Education, except collegiate and European, has been transferred. The presidents of local boards, municipalities, union boards and village panchayats are given effective control. These local bodies are, as a matter of fact, inspecting most of these institutions, and it is meet, therefore, to curtail the cost of inspection and divert the grant on buildings to more useful purposes, e.g., starting new institutions or the fresh supply of books or providing better sets of teachers with adequate salaries. The passing of the Elementary Education Act will be meaningless if education will be limited, as is now, only to 4·2 per cent of the whole population in Madras. I can assure the House that the Government can never achieve the desired effect unless it strengthens the resources of the local bodies. I am very sorry to read from the reports of Public Instruction for 1919–20 that the average cost of educating an Indian boy is Rs. 5–13–0, while that of an European or an Anglo-Indian is Rs. 193·52."

8th March 1921] [The Hon'ble Sir Lionel Davidson]

The Hon'ble Sir LIONEL DAVIDSON (*interrupting*) :—"May I ask, Sir, whether the comparison is not monthly in one case and yearly in the other?"

Sriman BISWANATH DAS (*continuing*) :—"In both cases, I speak of the annual expenditure."

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT :—"In both cases?"

Sriman BISWANATH DAS (*continuing*) :—"Yes, Sir. I would refer the Honourable Member to the report of Public Instruction of 1919–20. I am very sorry to note from the reports of Public Instruction that the average cost of educating an Indian boy is Rs. 5–13–0 while that of an European or an Anglo-Indian is 193·52 per year. If India and Anglo-India were to live as brothers in the same house with feelings of amity and fraternity, such glaring disparity in the interests of both the communities should very soon disappear.

"Then comes the Police department, which grows sooner, I am afraid, than the moon. I am afraid that in course of time, this branch of administration like the military expenditure would consume half of our limited resources. The Government should be better advised to effect a root and branch reform. As yet, I have failed to understand why a costly sub-inspector as a reader is attached to each of the District Superintendent and Deputy Superintendent when a clerk of a lower salary could do the same service and thus effect a lot of savings. The system of circle inspectors which has been brought into existence since a decade is to be thoroughly examined and retained only on strict necessity. Indians should be put in charge of districts and such other higher offices to ensure a minimum of expenditure.

"The report of the Industrial Commission deplores the neglect of the Fisheries department by the Madras Government and points out how the Bengal Government have made the department a successful and useful one to the people. Labour and sanitation equally share their ill-fated slices; but what is worse, the Hon'ble the Finance Member holds out no hope of extending his help for some years to come as the revenue could only cover expenditure.

"On a thorough scrutiny of the budget, one feels as if the activities of the Government are to remain at a standstill, or as the Hon'ble Member Mr. Todhunter says, the 'carrying on' budget will drag on with little scope for any kind of new activity. We fail to understand how the Finance Member arrives at nearer to 5 per cent as the charges of tax collection. I state here the figures to ascertain the real charges of collection—

	(In crores.)	Collection charges.
(1) Land Revenue	622·68	199·62
(2) Excise	556·10	48·47
(3) Forest	58·86	30 66
(4) Irrigation	89·48	32·51
(5) Registration	33·62	22·23

"I need not make any remarks as the facts speak for themselves.

"It pains me to state that the Hon'ble Mr. Todhunter has not realized the condition of our masses. The cultivating classes are always very nearly on the verge of starvation. The increasing taxation, he (Mr. Todhunter) believes, has affected almost slowly the consumers of foreign goods and the earners of large income on trades, while the ryot, who grows rice, especially that the settlement was based on the prices of 20 or 30 years ago, has been able to reap enormous profit.

True it is that the trader and the consumer of foreign goods pay into the treasury, the former for his profitable income and the latter as the result of customs duty which affects him indirectly. It must be admitted that the trading classes have and are still making very high profits owing to the abnormal rise in prices at the cost of the poor leaving them poorer still. Profits, during the war and after, are proverbially high and it is therefore meet that they should pay a proportion of profits to the benefit of those poverty-stricken ryots whose money they have taken. The poor are the consumers of foreign goods. The trade returns for 1917–20 give us an idea of the industrial dependency of our people. In 1917–18 the imports amounted to 244·09 crores; in 1918–19, the imports amounted to 255·2 crores."

The Hon'ble Sir LIONEL DAVIDSON (*interrupting*):—"May I ask, Sir, how this interesting discussion of trade returns is relevant to the budget of the Madras Government?"

Sriman BISWANATH DAS (*continuing*):—"It is relevant in this way, Sir, just to explain how the consumers of foreign goods who are mostly the poor people indirectly pay the treasury in customs duty; so they are indirectly taxed. In this way it is 'relevant'."

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT:—"The Honourable member is nearing his time."

Sriman BISWANATH DAS (*continuing*):—"The masses who are mainly consumers of these heavy imports are the people who have really borne the burdens of taxation. All these general causes have added to the following local causes:—

(1) The famines throughout the Presidency with the exception of the Delta districts.

(2) The very high rise in the expenditure of the costs of cultivation combined with the low outturn as the result of the deterioration of the fertility of the soil.

(3) Heavy and unrestricted export of raw materials and food-stuffs. The ryot was happier even in the years 1915–17 owing to the restricted exports.

(4) The ryots of the zamindari areas have little or no savings as the unearned increment of the soil goes to the zamindar. In the unsettled zamindaris the zamindars take away full half and even more of the gross produce without even allowing to the cost of cultivation which has risen very high.

"Dr. Voelker writes that 'throughout large portions of the Peninsula, large areas are cultivated, and large areas usually are available for grazing. Neither the Government nor the zamindars have encouraged intensive cultivation. Extensive cultivation is encouraged and so all the poorer classes of land are exploited at high agricultural expenses only to the benefit of the zamindars'."

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT:—"Order, order. Has the honourable member come to the end of his speech or does he intend to read to the end of his quotation?"

Sriman BISWANATH DAS:—"I am reading only the last paragraph. The Hon'ble the Finance Member has spoken about the enhancing of the local rates on the ground that the local bodies in the western countries pay higher. In considering the question, distinction must be drawn between commercial and agricultural countries with their respective income of the people. Take for instance the local taxation in England, where local income includes land tax and excise revenue, grants from the exchequer and many other local rates. So the comparison instituted by the Hon'ble the Finance Member as to the incidence of local taxation in England and in India has no bearing. . . ."

8th March 1921] [The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. Todhunter]

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—" I rise to a point of order, Sir I do not quite understand how income can be made up of taxes. I think the honourable member has completely misunderstood the statement in my memorandum."

Sriman BISWANATH DAS :—" Alright, Sir, I do not think I have at all misunderstood I am going to close my speech. The time has not come, Sir, to discuss questions here in vernaculars. Bihar and Orissa and the Punjab have already begun this and we have only to follow them. Much do I like to speak in my own vernacular, i.e., Oriya, for the electorate have a right to know what we are doing here. I am afraid I shall not be understood by most of the members of the House. I therefore implore the Government and the members of this House to allow the Oriya-speaking tracts to join with their brethren in Bihar and Orissa and give me my natural right of expressing my thoughts in the vernacular. In so doing, Sir, I am just asking what the authors of the Montagu-Chelmsford report and the 5th Despatch of the Government of India have recommended."

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—" It was usual, Sir, in the previous Councils every year to congratulate the Finance Member really or in an imaginary way on the satisfactory budget produced by him. I am sorry to-day nobody has done it yet. I thought I might do it and was only trying to see how I could do it. By a comparison of the deficits of other provinces probably, I think I may be able to congratulate the Hon'ble the Finance Member. In Bombay with an income of 14 crores, they had larger deficit, than we have got. In Bengal also it was the same thing. They had a deficit of 134 lakhs with an expenditure of only 11 crores. Therefore the Finance Member should be congratulated on the fact that with an expenditure of 17 crores he has been able to manage things with only a deficit of 30 lakhs. So in that way we may congratulate him."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—" May I say to the Honourable Member, Sir, that there is no deficit in the budget ? "

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—" Of course there is no deficit in the budget if we take the loan into consideration."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—" Yes, even taking the loan into consideration the receipts would still be more than the expenditure."

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—" All I can say, Sir, is that I am speaking from the figures given in the budget supplied to me day before yesterday. Unless those figures are wrong I think I am right. The time taken by this cross-examination may not be included in the 20 minutes allotted to me. Otherwise no member will have time to speak if such cross-examination is allowed. The very first thing I read yesterday at page 2 of the budget was that there was a deficit of 30 and odd lakhs. I suppose the revised edition contains also the same figure. We had a preliminary edition of the budget supplied last Saturday and to-day there is another edition in substitution of the previous one. I am not able to find any correction so far as my copies are concerned. Unless the object of the Finance Member was to confuse us what could have been done was to give us a list of corrections so that those who read some portions of the preliminary budget yesterday might be enabled to know what those corrections were."

Diwan Bahadur M. RAMACHANDRA RAO PANTULU :—" I should like to rise to a point of order, Sir, as to whether it is open to Honourable Members to refer to the second edition or the corrected edition of the estimates presented to us to-day. I contend, Sir, that the estimates that can be discussed by the House are those as originally presented."

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—" I still doubt whether some of the figures will not be corrected and another new edition presented to-morrow.

" Take for instance the Forest Department. It was given in reply to my question about the 14th February or so that two additional appointments of Conservators of Forests had been made and within a week or so—I do not know the exact time—I hope there will be no cross-examination—two Europeans were appointed permanently as conservators who in anticipation of the sanction of the Secretary of State had been given special appointments. But still what do we find in the budget? We see that only four conservators are shown, whereas for the new scheme of two conservators Rs. 80,000 has been provided. I do not know whether the budget is prepared to confuse members. Probably within a week or two everything will be corrected. If this is a correct edition, that expenditure item should have been shown under establishments and the number of conservators should have been 6 instead of 4. Therefore I say the Honourable Members of this Council on the Government benches are sometimes fallible."

The Hon'ble Sir LIONEL DAVIDSON :—" May I say, Sir, in correction of the statement of the Honourable Member that I understand the figures will be worked into the next edition of the budget. The Secretary of State's sanction was received after the budget had been worked out and a lump provision is therefore entered."

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—" The budget was prepared about a month ago and there is no necessity for the revision of the same. They have much work to do and probably some mistakes are allowed to remain there. Very well, Sir, we are told that retrenchment is an additional income. The Right Honourable Member for Finance . . . ."

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT :—" Will the Honourable Member please resume his seat? The Honourable Member is not entitled to the appellation of the term 'Right Honourable.' I would ask the Honourable Member to stick to the term 'Honourable Member.'"

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—" Though it is another point, Sir, we are not entitled to the prefix honourable and yet we are called by that title."

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT :—" Will the Honourable Member please resume his seat? I expect Honourable Members to abide by my rulings."

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—" I was simply explaining myself, Sir."

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT :—" The Honourable Member may proceed with the discussion?"

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—" I was simply saying that the Hon'ble the Finance Member has stated in the beginning of his budget speech that this is a 'carrying on' budget. I am afraid not only will it carry, but it will labour and bring forth a monster in the way of additional taxation. We have clear indications of this additional taxation over the poor. Of course it is said that there are other ways of meeting the demands in future, but our demand in this one year has exceeded that of last year by 6 crores and the expenses came up to 17 crores, whereas last year the expenditure was only 11 crores. When in this year's budget there is an increase of 6 crores over that of the previous one, is it possible to expect that the same expenditure would not continue in the year to come? I am afraid it is a question like that of the mother-in-law and daughter-in-law refusing to give charity. This year the Government

of India has taken the part of being the mother-in-law and next year probably the Government of Madras will act the part of the daughter-in-law for the purpose of levying some taxes. I say it deliberately because the question of retrenchment is only imaginary. I may give some instances. So far as the question of salaries is concerned, I am not speaking of the salaries of the lower officials but of the European gentlemen. Nobody takes so much interest in the administration as the lower officials. Taking into consideration the position of these people they try to please the Europeans around whom they live and they do not take the whole population into consideration. It was said a few days ago by an European Member, and I see very few of them this morning, that the clerk should be paid less because the masses in whose midst they live get small incomes. There is no reason why the clerks who live among the people should be paid less and the Europeans and other officers who also live among them are paid much more. What I say is that these members of the lower establishments are placed in such a position and in such surrounding that while much is wanted by their superiors something is wanted by them also. I hope that hereafter all distinctions between the Provincial and Imperial Services which seem to have been existing for a sufficiently long period will be abolished, as I believe that distinction has already ceased to exist in the Public Works Department, where I understand Europeans are said to be paid some allowances because they are Europeans. I am simply referring to this fact with a view to show that it is impossible for our clerks and the officers of the Provincial Service to be satisfied with small sums when they see that people who do the same work or less work sometimes are paid much more. Let me take the instance of Collectors. Twenty-two Indian Civil Service Collectors are paid 7 lakhs of rupees, whereas three Provincial Service officers who are also Collectors are paid at practically half the rate and receive only 56 thousands. So far as the retrenchment is concerned, the budget is so cleverly prepared that probably we will have no retrenchment. Under the heading of 'Civilian District Officers' and 'Subdivisional officers' an expenditure of 21 lakhs has been provided and a 'probable savings' of 5 lakhs is shown. I do not know whether the civil servants are going to give up one-fourth of their present pay, and I am afraid there will be no saving at all. I think that it is only with a view to show that both sides are equal, that that saving of 5 lakhs is shown there. The Honourable Members will see in every department that the pay of a particular European officer is much larger than the pay of all the other subordinate officers in his office. Let me take the instance of Collectors. The civilian Collectors are paid 7 lakhs, but the establishments so far as the collectorates are concerned including those of the Provincial Service Collectors are paid less than 4 lakhs. The same is the case so far as the civil judges are concerned. Take the case of a civil judge and you will see that his pay is far more than what is received by all the other subordinate officers in his office including the sarishtadar who probably does a good portion of the work in the office."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—"Is it suggested, Sir, that the Sarishtadar tries the cases?"

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—"I was simply saying, Sir, that, so far as the pay of the Judge and Collector was concerned, without referring to the nature of work, but so far as the executive work is concerned the Sarishtadar does far more work than the Collector or the Judge. They place before their masters all papers with office-notes which later on very often take the shape of orders. There are of course very honourable exceptions, but some officers merely say 'yes' or 'no' on these notes. Many of us know it within

our experience, and the Honourable Indian Civil Service Members on the front benches on the other side may be very honourable exceptions and I do not say anything against them. It is well known that office-notes will more or less lead to similar office orders. That is the reason, Sir, why the civilians in Madras Presidency do not generally know the vernaculars. It was said at the last Council by the Hon'ble Mr. C. G. Todhunter that the proportion between the higher officers and the lower officers in this Presidency was six times as large as that in some other presidencies, viz., Bombay and Bengal. What does it show? It shows that the establishments here are generally intended for the purpose of note-making and some other similar work. The civilians in South India want a larger number of clerks than the civilians in Bengal or Bombay. One of the chief reasons is that the civilians here do not know the vernaculars, whereas it is well known that the civilians in Bengal and Bombay know very well the vernacular languages because everybody insists there on speaking in the vernaculars. So when the Collector or Judge or the Executive Engineer or any other officer is paid a much larger salary than the whole establishment consisting of even 20, 30 or even 40 members, there is naturally much discontent, and when the Provincial Civil Service officers who work as Collectors see that the civilians who do the same work as Collectors are paid more, the discontent is all the greater. No doubt it is said that retrenchment will be made under the guidance of His Excellency in the administration. We are glad that His Excellency is going to help us in the matter. We will be very much obliged to His Excellency if he does so. We see however that, large sums have been budgeted even so far as His Excellency is concerned. I do not say that His Excellency is a party to it. The expenses of his own personal staff have been increased several times in the new budget. At page 61 it is shown what His Excellency's expenses are going to be this year. That shows, Sir, if I may say so, the signs of the retrenchment we are going to have. If between the last year and this year we are not going to have retrenchment, but only large increases in His Excellency's expenses what then is the retrenchment we are to have? For instance, take his own staff. The expenditure for the staff for 1921–22 is to be about 4 lakhs and 15 thousands, whereas in 1920–21 it was 2 lakhs and 80 thousands."

The Hon'ble Sir LIONEL DAVIDSON:—"May I ask if the Honourable Member has read the memorandum which the Finance Member put before this House in introducing the budget in which he gives reasons for the increase of expenditure?"

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR:—"I do not say that there is no explanation. I was simply saying that instead of retrenchment, there were increases, and, as usual, explanations are given in support of them. They may be very good explanations. These explanations we may also have next time. I do not say that explanations are . . ."

The HON'BLE Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER:—"May I rise to a point of order, Sir? It is not correct to say that the imposition by the Government of India on this Government of new charges implies that the staff of His Excellency the Governor is being increased. It is transferred from the Imperial to the Provincial account."

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR:—"And this province pays all that. The tour expenses of His Excellency for the year 1921–22 are to be Rs. 1,63,000 as against Rs. 1,07,000 last year. What I say is, Sir, that there is a very good opportunity for the Honourable Members on the other side to advise His

8th March 1921] [Mr. C. V. Venkataramana Ayyangar]

Excellency the Governor to whom we will all be very thankful if he reduces the expenses. We have no doubt that His Excellency himself will cause retrenchment by cutting down his own expense. The expenses His Excellency has to incur in his own department are to be very large."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—"May I rise to make a correction, Sir? These are not the touring expenses of His Excellency the Governor alone."

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—"I never said that they are the personal expenses of the Governor. I was saying that they are the expenses of the Governor and his staff."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—"And the Members of the Executive Council and the Ministers."

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—"I am afraid not. The Honourable Member will please wait for a minute before I come to that. It is said therein clearly that they are the touring expenses of the 'Head of the Province, etc.' There is no retrenchment under this head. If His Excellency only pleases, there can certainly be retrenchment in the touring expenses of himself, and his personal staff, such as Military Secretary, Private Secretary, etc. All these touring expenses are, Sir, for one year only."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—"Sir, the touring expenses which are being quoted are the touring expenses under the head 'Heads of Provinces—Executive Councillors and Ministers'. They are thus the touring expenses of all these officers."

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—"All that I can say is that the touring expenses I have dealt with are expenses under heading 22 A (C), are shown for His Excellency and his personal staff and that the touring expenses so far as the Executive Council are concerned are shown in account No. 22 A (I) as Rs. 40,000 in 1921-22 against Rs. 28,000 in 1920-21, while it should be much less. This year it has been promised they would not be staying in the Hills as long as before, and probably they will be touring into districts more. This year the expenditure under the first head is put down as 1·63 lakhs as against 1,07,000 last year. Unless the Secretary of State or the Viceroy call for an explanation this practice of increases would go on. Last year there were tours of the Executive Council and His Excellency the Governor at a lesser cost."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—"May I say, Sir, that there were no Ministers last year?"

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—"I know that and I will continue. The retrenchment should begin from the top and reference has been made to this fact by other Members also. It would not be out of place here to say that at the head of the Government seven people are now doing the work of three Members hitherto. I may go further, Sir, and that nine are doing that work, as His Excellency was President hitherto, but now there are His Excellency, the President, and seven Members, and these nine people are now doing the work that was being done before by three Members. Unfortunately for us, and reference has been already made to that fact, we cannot vote the salaries of Executive Councillors but we can only submit a request. If there is a vacancy among them as it is rumoured, there will be one soon, I submit, that need not be filled up. As far as Ministers are concerned I do not want to say anything now because that subject will come up at some other time, and some other honourable

friends have spoken about it already. If therefore there is to be any retrenchment at all, it should come from above. There should be a general levelling. There is no use of abolishing a few clerks' posts here, a few peons' posts there, not even those of a few sub-inspectors. The rise has been gradual and the rise has been successive year after year. The whole budget shows, as the Hon'ble Mr. C. G. Todhunter has been able to say, that there has been a reduction only in the Salt department."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER:—"May I correct the Honourable Member, Sir? The reduction was in the Police department."

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR:—"Yes, there was probably some reduction in the Police department only so far as this year is concerned, but I was referring not to this year but to the figures for 1919-20 also."

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT:—"Do I understand the Honourable Member to say that he is discussing the budget not only of this year but of previous years?"

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR:—"No, Sir, I am only discussing the budget of this year and comparing it with that of previous years. What I say is that there can be no retrenchment because there has been no retrenchment for the past so many years. I have absolutely nothing to say in reference to the previous budgets. What I say is that unless serious attempts are made in retrenchment with the help of His Excellency, and unless a strong committee of this Council is appointed, it will be absolutely useless. So far as the public and this Council are concerned, there is no use of retrenchment here and there. It should be from top to bottom. The unfortunate thing is that everywhere higher officers are increased, higher services are increased and the same is the case with their salaries. I do not want to trouble the House with the number of these persons, but there is the fact that higher officers are increasing in number. It may be some lower establishments also are increased. The result is that so far as the public are concerned, they are afraid certainly of additional taxation. There is another point also, Sir. We all know, Sir, what an increase in the officers and their staff means. It means that in addition to higher salaries leading to increasing taxes the villages are to be put to more trouble by way of supplies and other things. Whereas they used to supply only one Tahsildar or one assistant or deputy collector before, they have now got at least 15 officers, some Vaccinator, Salt officer, Forest officer, etc., etc. This Government somehow or other wants to have a large number of officers. Take the Forest Department itself. It is a department which is considered to be very troublesome so far as the public are concerned. No one can envy me the position of belonging to a district where there are four District Forest officers. Not only that, one-third of the whole district is covered with reserved forests and therefore one can very well understand how the people of Coimbatore suffer from the Forest department. It is said that the Forest Department is a department which yields a good income. But unfortunately, the budget shows that income and expenditure are almost equal. When people are troubled. . . ."

The Hon'ble Sir LIONEL DAVIDSON:—"May I rise to inquire, Sir, whether the Honourable Member has read paragraph 13 of the memorandum presented by the Finance Member in connexion with the Forest Department, and also whether his time-limit has not been exceeded?"

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR:—"I have read it and I may request the Honourable Member to read it again. So far as I have read, I maintain this position. If it is wrong, I am open to correction. It is stated in that memorandum that this year the yield has been fairly good and with all expenditure on it in previous years the Forest department has since begun to yield. The expenditure and income, so far as this year is concerned are, I do not say exactly, but practically the same. I put it to the House through you, Sir, is it desirable that such things should go on? All that I wish to say regarding officers is that men of the Provincial Service are able to do the work done by the men of the Imperial Service. Retrenchment can be effected in two ways, namely cutting down the number of officers from the top to the bottom. There is no use of cutting down the appointments of a few clerks here and a few peons there. Take the case of about 200 peons, and when we calculate it, their pay is after all nothing when compared with that of 6 conservators and it is not equal to half the pay of two conservators of forests, and two such appointments have been recently provided by the Government when we are all crying for retrenchment. These two appointments might have been kept vacant. So far as these experts are concerned, I may give an example in my district, simply to show the fact."

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT.—"The Honourable Member is no doubt aware that he has well passed the time-limit."

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR:—"I was not aware of it, Sir, but I will certainly finish soon. I request you, Sir, to reduce the time taken by me by the time taken up by cross-examination and all that. What I was about to say was only in the nature of a general observation. I would appeal to the Hon'ble the Finance Member and the other Members on the right front bench of this Council to take into their consideration a non-expert view. I have been told and I have read several reports that the appointment of Chief Conservator of Forests has helped the Government very much because he can understand the department well. I have also heard some people say that so far as the department is concerned, he is helpful only to the European members."

The Hon'ble Sir LIONEL DAVIDSON:—"Is the Honourable Member in order, Sir, in making such an implication? He is virtually condemning the head of a great department. I ask you, Sir, if there is not an implication in this."

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR:—"There is no implication at all. What I say is that he is more in touch with the higher European officials but he is not in touch with the people and their grievances so as to remedy them. He is not also in touch with the men of the Provincial Service. I may add it is the same with regard to the other departments.

"I am coming to experts and shall finish with that. It is very often said that the people near a holy place are always unholy. So far as Coimbatore is concerned, it is a district which has got the luxury of four District Forest Officers but also the Forest College and the Agricultural College. Coimbatore produces a number of valuable products, cotton, betel, etc. Betel is produced as the soil is favourable for the growth of that crop, within four or five miles of the Agricultural College. There, worms have come and eaten away the betel crop, which has become absolutely useless. Attempts were made to get the experts of the Agricultural department. Even now I am in correspondence with the Director, who referred me to the lower experts. Though I requested the Director to come and see the place, in person, he has referred me to the Entomologist. I wanted to be sure of something being done but he said it would be more

convenient if I wrote to his subordinates. The Entomologist had been informed before but to no use. So far as the betel is concerned, the worm still eats away a large portion of the manure. I will now refer to the cotton crop. A great doctor. . . . ."

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT:—"I really do not want to interrupt the honourable member. Apparently he feels very strongly in the matter and therefore I should like to allow him some time; but in fairness to the other Honourable Members I must say he has exceeded his time-limit. I had hoped that he would have some regard for general rules. I trust that he will wind up."

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR:—"Thank you, Sir, I am winding up presently. As regards experts, I am reminded of an old doctor who prescribed the amputation of a leg when it was complained to him that there was pain there. The cotton growers of Coimbatore district suffered very much on account of the cotton worm which spoiled the crop. So far as some taluks are concerned, August and September are very good yielding months. When the people complained of worms, they were asked to remove all the plants in the whole district on or before the 1st of August whether there were fruits or flowers because of these germs and to keep the lands vacant like that for two or three months. Of course, there would be no cotton plants and therefore no germs. Therefore I simply say that experts are not sometimes of great utility and our great faith in experts is of no use.

"So far as the Educational department is concerned, I simply want to say a word about the present system, so far as the College department is concerned. The subordinate officers of that Department were getting before grade increments and used to get Rs. 225 in about ten years under the old scale. It was much better than the present scale under which it will take twenty years for them to get that grade.

"Real retrenchment, Sir, will come only if we make real useful efforts and I hope that such efforts will really be made by all soon."

Mr. R. SRINIVASA AYYANGAR:—"Mr. President, I find myself really unable to offer my congratulations to the Finance Member, not because that in my opinion he does not deserve them but because I fear that the congratulations from any member of this House or from me in particular might perhaps make him think that there is nothing radically wrong with the budget. Although he has the gratification and the satisfaction of presenting his budget under the new dispensation for the consideration and discussion of this Council, I fear it is his luck—certainly bad luck I think—to witness this spectacle by no means pleasant of the budget, his own creation, lying on the table in front of him being dissected by doctors and laymen under his very nose. I do not at all blame him for the budget, for as the Finance Member, he has to cut his coat according to his cloth. But my complaint is that the cloth he has purchased is very costly and that he has paid more than its face-value.

"Now, I should like with the permission of the President and of the House to offer only a few remarks. Already I find the flood-gates of criticism being directed with a vengeance against the Finance Member who I dare say is in a position to take care of himself. So far as I am concerned I feel it incumbent upon me to offer a few remarks of a general nature. When I went through the memorandum this morning and when I sat down after getting through it, a feeling of depression swept over me. The very first thing that arrested my

attention as soon as I took this paper was the seductive words or phrase 'carrying on.' Being new to the Council, not being familiar with this expression, I was at my wits' end to know what the phrase really connoted. When I sat down I was soliloquising within myself about the region to which I found a close perusal of this budget had carried me on. I found myself being carried swiftly, rapidly, right through and placed on the very verge of bankruptcy. That is the feeling which I find it difficult or impossible to resist. And after hearing some of the trenchant criticisms that have been presented by various speakers, I regret to note that the feeling of depression has become somewhat firmer. There is a loud complaint all over the country that we must carry on the retrenchment policy with a vengeance. TLat new appointments have been created, that higher emoluments have been offered, that extravagant time-scales have been sanctioned — these are all matters of common knowledge into the details of which it would be profitless to go at length. But this much we are bound to state for the consideration of this House, namely, that when the Government, for some reason or other, thought it necessary to better the condition of their own officers, they should have applied their mind to the men in the lower rungs of the ladder and instead of that they have chosen to begin from the top. That is the reason why some of the Honourable Members who have previously spoken wanted to attack the huge top of the administration. The reason appears to be that the officers, whose salary had been raised very largely, had not been hit hard to any appreciable extent by this economic stress, and if at all they had been affected, only a portion of their savings would have been affected. I am in favour of retrenchment all through at once, provided the retrenchment commences from the top. But if for some reason or other it is resolved to commence retrenchment from the bottom I, for one, would certainly resist it, for I am afraid that not only it would be a suicidal step to take but at the same time it would land the administration into a chaos and it is likely to set dark forces of disorder and discontent unchecked and untrammelled.

"Page 2 of the memorandum gives us some of the statistics which furnish amusing reading. I was at a loss to understand why the statement indicating the figures for the last three decades should be set out there. We find under the heading Land Revenue, the income going up by 60 per cent from 1891 to 1921. Is it for the purpose of satisfying us or satisfying the public that the people in this country are growing rich and prosperous? If it were stated by any member of this House that it is a sign of prosperity, that it shows that people are growing rich, I venture to submit that people are growing rich in the immensity of their poverty. Far from showing that the people are becoming rich that only shows that the Government have been able to realize this amount in the short space of thirty years. As regards excise revenue the income in 1891–92 was 121·25 lakhs: now, the budgeted income for the ensuing year is 556·1. It has gone up by 450 per cent. What does that show, Sir? It shows indubitably that the drink evil is on the increase. It does not necessarily show that the people are growing rich but it shows that the bad habit, notwithstanding certain restrictions, has got a firm hold. In these days when people are everywhere trying to reduce intemperance and ensure temperance, it is sad to contemplate the Government realizing as much as five and a half crores of rupees, very much more than one-third of the total income realizable by the local bodies. That is really a sorry spectacle.

"Various speakers have referred to various aspects of situation and members of this House may know that it is often said by publicists and politicians that industrial education must precede political education. We, members of this

House, are supposed to be the products of political education. What about the industrial education that ought to have preceded it? Going through the budget, I do not find that the budget contains any programme in the direction of industrial education. It is incumbent upon the department of Industry to see that industrial schools imparting education in commerce and other fields of activity are opened at important centres; for it seems to me that the time is come when the country, to survive itself and to find its proper place in the comity of nations must have men of the muscle. I would certainly prefer a man of the muscle to a man of the brain. I have not been able to perceive so far, anything striking or illuminating in the memorandum submitted to us by the Hon'ble the Finance Member.

"The Honourable Member for Cuddapah was rather hard upon the talaiyaris. I confess, with all respect to him, that I am for the continuance of the old system of village talaiyaris. The police also came in for a certain amount of criticism at the hands of some of the members. Though I am against the reduction of the police establishment as a whole, I for one am for the reduction of one section of that department, which has been a source of annoyance, of unnecessary irritation to many respectable men and that department is none other than the Criminal Investigation or the Intelligence Department that exists for the purpose of shadowing and annoying respectable persons. I have known some of those people going about the country . . ."

The Hon'ble Sir Lionel Davidson (*interrupting*):—"May I ask, Sir, whether the Honourable Member is in order in saying that the department exists only for the purpose of shadowing and annoying respectable persons?"

Mr. R. Srinivasa Ayyangar:—"That is the effect of it and I have known some instances and I suggested it, Sir; I am conscious that I am not abusing the privilege—I am a lawyer myself—and I make the statement with full sense of responsibility . . ."

The Hon'ble the President:—"The Honourable Member had better address the chair."

Mr. R. Srinivasa Ayyangar:—"With regard to medical aid, members of this House are aware that the spending departments are in charge of the Ministers. Whether it is done purposely to bring the ministry into discredit or not . . ."

The Hon'ble the President:—"I do not know whether that has anything to do with the subject. What is the object of saying that the transfer was carried out for the purpose of discrediting the Ministers? It is travelling far beyond the scope of the discussion. I am anxious not to interfere in any way with the course of the debate. I must appeal to all honourable members to recognize that the reputation of the Council is in their own hands and if they indulge in speeches made at random the House will suffer in reputation. I appeal to the Honourable Member himself to consider whether it is worth while putting this aspect before the House."

Mr. R. Srinivasa Ayyangar:—"I do not pursue it, Sir. By way of argument I thought I might bring in those facts. But in deference to the chair, I won't pursue it any further. So far as the department in charge of the Ministers is concerned, everybody recognizes that these departments are what are known as spending departments, the departments of public health and sanitation. It is therefore necessary that we must find funds for the purpose of strengthening the

departments wherewith the departments may be able to launch into existence many schemes of practical value and utility. It will be a solace and satisfaction to the agriculturists and to the tax-payers. Suppose we go back to our houses and we are put the question 'out of the budget revenue of about sixteen and odd crores how much money is to be given for our betterment', we are bound to give a satisfactory answer. And I have only this obligation in mind, viz., that it is incumbent on the House to frame the budget so as to strengthen the hands of the Ministers and thereby directly see that the money benefits or profits the people in this country.

"And as regards medical institution, I for one would certainly welcome the employment of an extra assistant surgeon in district headquarters ; for, whenever serious epidemics like cholera or plague or small-pox prevails we find it difficult to have recourse to medical aid. I do not think the appointment of one extra surgeon for every district is likely to drain the resources of the Medical department.

"Then so far as the presidency magistrates in this City are concerned, I understand that there are 94 honorary magistrates who work once a week and I have had interviews with them and some of them have told me that they are able to get through the work before 2 or 3 p.m. When you have a large number of 94 honorary magistrates the question that naturally arises for the consideration is as to the necessity for four stipendiary magistrates in the City. I refer to this for the purpose of showing how far it is desirable or possible to direct our attention to various items of retrenchment and to see if particular items could not be cut down and some more money allotted for objects of greater importance and greater utility. As regards the village officers and also the non-gazetted officers, there has been a universal cry ; but the real difficulty seems to be one of funds and I am not quite sure, though I will be glad, if some extra allowance is given to them, say an addition of Rs. 5 to what is recommended by the new Salaries Committee. I may also tell the Finance Member that people will be satisfied if in addition to their being put on a time-scale their past services are also reckoned and that will be the nature of a compromise which I state for the sympathetic consideration of the Finance Member, although I know it is not certainly binding upon him. And as for the reduction of salaries of Ministers and other things, I do not think that this is the stage for that and I think some of us may reserve our remarks when the matter comes up for discussion at a later stage.

"On the whole, I venture to submit with confidence that this budget cannot be regarded as a hopeful budget but must be viewed as an unsatisfactory and disappointing one. Unless it is possible for us to retrench all along the line, and to put our efforts in the direction of economy, I am afraid it is likely not only to place us on the verge of bankruptcy but actually precipitate and plunge us into the abyss of bankruptcy which, however, I have not the slightest doubt true statesmanship will try to avoid. With these observations, I shall close my remarks."

Mr. S. SOMASUNDARAM PILLAI :—"Mr. President, I have been very closely listening to the speeches of many honourable members and after listening to them I have found many discoveries. One is that the position of the Hon'ble the Finance Member is a very unenviable one. The second is the starting of the new era of Reformed Government is a very happy one. For it is better to start with deficits than to end with the same. So, I am very glad that the budget is one with a deficit balance.

"As regards general remarks on the budget, I have very little to add to what has already been said. The sources of income are chiefly from lands and excise. The highest is that from lands where the income has multiplied from 392 lakhs to 620 lakhs. Next comes excise. Let us see who pays these taxes. The land revenue the land-owners pay; and the excise the poor man pays; for, the majority of the liquor consumed is toddy and toddy is drunk only by poor people. And it is their money that goes to accumulate a large amount of this income. As regards stamps it is the litigants that pay. And forests, of course, the poor people as well as the rich pay. The income from registration is largely from rich people and that from irrigation from the landlords.

"Next, whether the expenditure goes to the benefit of the tax-payers. As regards the land revenue, the collection of revenue, it goes without saying that there should be officers to collect the moneys from the tax-payers. But having too many of them is the same as saying that too many cooks spoil the broth. As regards stamps it is only a self-inflicted tax. It is the litigants who go to the court that pay for them. We need not feel much sorry for it. But the judicial administration consumes a great deal of money. And unfortunately the taxes levied by the Government are not so much as the taxes levied by the litigation itself. The litigant pays not only to the stamps and court expenses but to the vakils, and to the man who sends him to the vakil's house. There is no use of finding fault with the Government because the tax has increased. It is the litigation that reduces the country to pauperism. It is the litigation that has reduced the country to such a poor condition. For that, who is to blame? A part of that blame should be found in the judicial administration. Of course courts are increasing and judges are more increasing. Of course I cannot find fault with the judges; because they are paid and they are doing their work. But we do not know what they do. Generally, one bench finds one way and another bench in a quite contrary way. I have myself the practical experience of it. I have myself lost one case. Apart from that, as regards the protective works, I see the administration of Police has awfully increased. It has increased from 140 to 146 lakhs. Correspondingly the jail administration has also increased. If Police has increased there must be less work for the jails and I do not understand why there should be this corresponding increase in both. That clearly shows that the Police department is not working well and does not deserve any increase. But these are all minor things according to my view. But there is one important item and that is education. I pay more attention to education. Of course there was a complaint that only 17 lakhs of rupees is given to higher education. I say that that is even too much now; for, it is time for the Indians themselves to have arts colleges supported by their own money. The Government need not pay the ordinary arts colleges except the science branch. We must encourage only science, for it is science that won the great war; it is science that made the Germans so great; it is science that made them to defy the whole world. So it is this science that will make India great. Only science should be encouraged; and all other arts, what are they? All other graduates are only consumers but not producers. So, except science, I am against other education. Those who like higher education in other branches, let them encourage it by organizing their own establishments. In my opinion, 17 lakhs is too much. As regards primary education, very little is allotted to it. Only one lakh is allotted. There are eight million panchamas. It comes to less than three pies to each panchama. It is very little. It will have no effect at all for elevating these panchamas. Of course they say that 25 lakhs is given to primary education. Analyse it very

well; it gives very little to people who deserve primary education. Every labourer, if he is educated well, becomes a silkful labourer and secondary education is necessary to have a general knowledge of the world, to have the benefits of the good Government and to behave himself in a better way suitable to the conditions of the country and the welfare of the people. As regards higher education, if it should be laid down that passed school finals are sufficient for Government posts, there will be none in the colleges except those who read for the sake of education. Others will stop with school final and then begin technical education. As regards industry the provision made is very little. What I mean by industry is such industries as the match-box industry, pin industry, button industry and so many little things which will go to swell the country. Of course, it is not our Indian instinct to turn our attention to commerce. In the world only commerce will bring in wealth and nothing else. Our people are primarily agricultural people and secondly Government official people. So many of us are unproductive labourers. So, unless we infuse the instinct of commerce in the minds of our people by giving professional education, we cannot improve our wealth. If that is done, any amount of tax can be levied. As regards payment of higher officers, there was some complaint. It may be reasonable. But what I say is that he is paid not so much for filling his stomach as for the responsibility that he bears. Every responsible officer should be properly paid. He has got more mental work than physical work. From the time of the East India Company, the pay has been increasing. We have heard of the time when the Governors of provinces were paid very little. Gradually, wiser statesmen came in and increased the salaries according to the responsibilities of the position which they occupy. So what all we can say is that there is no need for a number of officers of the same grade; for, it would be like having too many cooks with less number of guests. If we have too many officers already and if their pay be increased, let us not drive those that had already been employed. But our request would be not to add more.

"As regards the budget, it is only a proposal. All of us have got experience of a family budget. The budget exceeds our actual expenses. But here the Finance Member has very carefully given a little more amount, so that when cut down it may come to the actual expenses. In the matter of primary education and education of panchamas, as regards the discouraging of arts colleges, I am strongly for them. As regards the other items, I leave it to the Finance Member. The position of the Finance Member is a very difficult one. Of course, it is open to the Honourable Members to criticize the budget presented by him, but not so strictly as our Members seem to think. Of course, it is only those that digest well that ask for more food. It is the natural tendency of every nation and every country to demand more salaries. There are inferior officers crying for food and there are superior officers who are crying for costly dresses and other luxuries. It is left to the good sense of the Government to grant or not to grant their officers increased salaries. But the salary once given cannot be reduced. I am dead against it. As regards duty allowances, officers are supposed to be always on duty and I do not understand what that means. I am not much acquainted with the official ways. On the whole, whatever may be the opinion of the other members, I congratulate the Hon'ble the Finance Member for the able way in which he has presented the budget. I think he has anticipated all these attacks. They are welcome. For this year, our Ministers take this as a forewarning, for to be forewarned is to be forearmed, and they will be able to carry in the next year the administration in a very smooth manner without

any difficulty, because in the beginning they have experienced the difficulty. With these few words, I once more congratulate the Hon'ble the Finance Member and the Ministers."

Mr. T. C. TANGAVELU PILLAI :—" Mr. President, the budget which has been presented by the Hon'ble Member for Finance has two aspects. It is conciliatory in one way because it makes provision for the levy of fresh taxation. It is also revolutionary because it has produced no practical policy for the Ministers who are in charge of the transferred subjects to handle their subjects properly. Mr. President, this budget clearly shows when we objected to this system of diarchy we observed that it would not work properly because the control of the purse would not be in the hands of the Ministers. That has been the case now. The Member for Finance has merely made these Ministers to be in charge of their subjects without giving enough of funds to see that the subjects entrusted to them are carried out. Take the question of education. What could our Minister do with a small purse ?

" Mr. President, retrenchment is a thing which ought to be taken in hand. It ought not to be entirely left to the option of His Excellency and a few Council Members. We are not disputing it, but the question is whether we could get on without these things. A Committee of Ways and Means should be constituted to find out the funds necessary for the administration of the transferred subjects. For the present, the agitation of the non-gazetted officers is a thing which ought to be very carefully watched. It is these officers who wield the actual power. As Mr. Venkataramana Ayyangar observed, they are the backbone of the administration. Their cry should not be a cry in the wilderness. They have been asking for more for a long time and they must be satisfied. The question can be easily solved only by way of retrenchment in other directions.

" Now look at the budget of the Public Works Department. Many of the appointments which are created are needless for the present. The actual expenditure incurred, as shown in the estimates, though generally less, will ultimately be found to be very high and it will not be carried on without fresh taxation, and that must come tenfold next year. This being the case, the main things for retrenchment would be to stop all acquisition of lands and buildings or further extensions, until we are on a firm basis and until the wants of the people who really work are satisfied. Now, these subjects which are being placed in the hands of the Ministers should be carefully watched. Their hands must be strengthened, they must be given enough funds to carry on their work. I am sure the House will be in a position to strengthen their hands by giving them greater power and greater control and purse enough to carry on their work.

" Now the question of industry is a thing which ought not to be overlooked. As the budget stands, it does not show that Government are taking any steps to give industrial education to the people. The present cry is that the education imparted to our boys is useless and some people are of the opinion that it produces slave mentality, I would say a morbid mentality. It is high time that we started industrial schools ; for that purpose the recommendations of the Saddler's Report should be given effect to. The school final examination should be encouraged and the pupils should be able to earn a living wage. Nowadays, a graduate is able to get only a quill-driver's post on Rs. 30 or 35. There is no use of wasting time in collegiate education. It is high time that the Government should take into consideration the fact that these are the people for whom they should devote their money and give them proper training. Now

as regards the allotment to the University, nothing more should be done, and any extensions for university purposes should be stopped. Retrenchment in that line should be taken in hand immediately and a large sum of over 70 lakhs can be recouped to meet the wants of other purposes. With these few words, I submit that the budget presented is not very satisfactory."

Diwan Bahadur M. RAMACHANDRA RAO PANTULU :—" May I know, Sir, whether the House is to adjourn ? "

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT :—" No. Does any Honourable Member wish to speak ? "

The Rev. E. M. MACPHAIL :—" As far as I can see, the usual criticisms on the budget have been made, viz., that there is not enough money and that it is not desirable to impose taxation I do not propose to speak about the budget in general, but I may point out that people often raise their voices for economy in general, who at the same time are demanding increased expenditure on things in which they are interested and especially in the part of the country which they represent. What I want to do is to repeat what I said last year in favour of more generous treatment to aided schools and colleges. I have looked at the budget and I see that practically no increase has been proposed this year. The amount given to aided colleges last year was Rs. 1,15,000, and although it was pointed out that it was desirable to increase that sum, no increase has been made this year so far as I can make out. There has been some little addition made to the sums granted to secondary aided education. Now I do wish to impress upon this House and upon the Minister in charge of this subject first of all that aided schools and colleges are doing the work of the Government and that they are doing it at very much less cost than Government schools and colleges can. It is therefore desirable that Government should rather encourage aided schools and colleges than continue the policy of taking over more schools and colleges from private bodies on which they will have to make a large expenditure, solely because they are Government institutions. It is perfectly true that owing to the small amount which the Government grants to aided schools and colleges, teachers and lecturers in them are insufficiently paid. Also in some cases it may be, as pointed out by Dr. Slater, they are shamefully paid. What I want to insist upon is, when you are thinking of increasing the salaries of different people and when you are thinking of increasing the amount of salaries to elementary teachers, to secondary teachers and college lecturers and professors in Government employment, you should think at the same time of those who are doing a very large portion of educational work in this country. They should not be left in want. I do not wish to go into details but there is one thing that should be borne in mind. The sums in the budget for aided institutions show all that is given to them. You will find that a considerable portion of the money expended on Government institutions does not appear there, but is shown in the Public Works budget. For example, reference has been made to the large sum that is being expended on the extension of Queen Mary's College. I cannot help noticing that no less than a sum of 5 lakhs has been put down for buildings in connexion with that one college, while at the same time the whole grant for aided colleges for this year is Rs. 1,15,000. In the same way there is a very large sum being expended on new buildings at the Presidency College. But I am not grudging this. I want to protest against the idea which I fear is still lurking in some people's minds that these Government schools and colleges are under the special care of the department and the aided colleges have only to

get any crumbs that fall from the children's table. That is absolutely an erroneous idea. Secondly, I do think that when attempts are being made to increase the pay of secondary and other elementary teachers in Board schools and Government schools and the pay of lecturers and professors in the educational service, something ought to be done to assist those schools and colleges which are aided. Before I sit down then I wish to emphasize, what I said last year. I protested against the 'half the net cost' principle, and I wish to protest against it still. If Government says 'we have not got money, we cannot give you money,' I am willing to take that answer, but when Government clings to that principle as a kind of fetish, I protest against it. It is a very hard way of treating the aided schools and colleges. It is specially hard in the case of first-grade colleges. Sometimes we do not get even half the net cost, although it was intended when that principle was introduced, that the first-grade colleges should be treated very much more liberally. I should like to ask the Minister for Education to consider carefully, if he is going to revise things at all, whether he cannot do something more for the aided schools and colleges than has been done in the present budget."

Diwan Bahadur P. KESAVA PILLAI:—"I move that the House do adjourn."

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT:—"If that is the wish of the Honourable Members, I have no objection."

The Council adjourned at 5-4 p.m. to meet again at 11 a.m. the next day (9th March 1921).

L. D. SWAMIKANNU.
Secretary to the Legislative Council.

TRUTH ALONE TRIUMPHS